

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17581

Title: Volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic musculature in adults with spinal deformity

Reviewer's code: 02348457

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-03-16 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-05-16 10:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. the sample size is small, as only 19 patients. 2. Why only female patients were included, male patients were excluded? 3. More Figures illustrating fat infiltration and muscle loss.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17581

Title: Volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic musculature in adults with spinal deformity

Reviewer's code: 02444745

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-03-16 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-05-19 13:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an article about volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic musculature in adults with spinal deformity. However, there are some problems. At first, a display of the spinal deformity of the subjects is nyctarine, and the subjects might include variable deformities with variable parameters. There is no comparison between subjects and control. The relationship between volume and fat infiltration and spinal deformity is unclear.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17581

Title: Volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic musculature in adults with spinal deformity

Reviewer's code: 03067964

Reviewer's country: Sweden

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-03-16 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-04-06 20:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript describes an observational study of volume loss and fat infiltration of muscles associated with sagittal posture in patients with adult spinal deformity. I have just a few comments on the methodology. 1. The study design is unclear with respect to analysis units and how patients contribute observations to the different comparisons. It is important to recognize that the used statistical methods require statistically independent observations, see e.g. Ranstam J. Repeated measurements, bilateral observations and pseudoreplicates, why does it matter? Osteoarthritis Cartilage 2012;20:473-475. 2. It is also unclear whether other underlying assumptions (such as Gaussian distribution and homogeneous variance) are fulfilled and how this has been evaluated. 3. The purpose of investigating the relationship between muscle parameters and demographic data is unclear and should be explained. Depending on the purpose of the statistical analysis may need to be revised. For example, if the authors wish to estimate risk factors for volume loss and fat integration, a multiple regression model including adjustment for potential confounding factors may be useful. The inclusion of covariates should then be carefully considered, see Schisterman EF, Cole SR, Platt RW.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Overadjustment bias and unnecessary adjustment in epidemiological studies. *Epidemiol* 2009;20:488-495 and Cole SR, Platt RW, Schisterman EF, Haitao C, Westreich D, Richardson D, Poole C. Illustrating bias due to conditioning on a collider. *Int J Epidemiol* 2010;39:417-420. 4. The purpose of hypothesis testing the phantom data should be described. What kind of variability is tested? 5. The presentation of results should include information on the inferential uncertainty of estimated parameters, preferably in terms of 95% confidence intervals.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17581

Title: Volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic musculature in adults with spinal deformity

Reviewer's code: 03069451

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-03-16 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-04-07 22:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript presents a well-designed study with an accurate analysis of volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic-lower limb musculature in 19 patients with spinal deformity. The topic is original, interesting and useful for the orthopedic and rehabilitation community. The study is well performed and well described and, even if the sample size is not large, the accurate methods of analysis using MRI improve the value of the results. In my opinion the manuscript could be accept as is.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17581

Title: Volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic musculature in adults with spinal deformity

Reviewer's code: 03069451

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-03-16 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-04-07 22:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript presents a well-designed study with an accurate analysis of volume and fat infiltration of spino-pelvic-lower limb musculature in 19 patients with spinal deformity. The topic is original, interesting and useful for the orthopedic and rehabilitation community. The study is well performed and well described and, even if the sample size is not large, the accurate methods of analysis using MRI improve the value of the results. In my opinion the manuscript could be accept as is.