

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24932

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcome in primary total knee arthroplasty - a single institution analysis of 2180 primary total knee replacements

Reviewer's code: 02444730

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-16 17:04

Date reviewed: 2016-03-07 01:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I believe that many readers would like to see if there is any difference in functional outcome and complications between the three groups (group 1: normal weight, group 2: overweight, group 3: obese).

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24932

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcome in primary total knee arthroplasty - a single institution analysis of 2180 primary total knee replacements

Reviewer's code: 02699853

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-16 17:04

Date reviewed: 2016-03-10 19:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Obesity and TKA is a hot topic with controversies between the different studies published. Your study is a good study but I think is mandatory analyze the results of your series dividing into subgroups of obesity. The simple diferentiation between normal weight cohort and overweight and obese cohort is not adequate. Numerous studies have shown the differences in outcome and morbidity between the different subgroups. A second concern: have not influenced the complications, in a greater number in obese group, in the quality of results? And third: the follow-up is too short, signaled for you in the limitations of the study. Recent relevant references missing.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24932

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcome in primary total knee arthroplasty - a single institution analysis of 2180 primary total knee replacements

Reviewer's code: 00505434

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-16 17:04

Date reviewed: 2016-03-12 10:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is well known that obesity contributes to peri-operative complications. This study further confirmed previous published data. The authors divided the study subjects into two groups: BMI < 25, and BMI > 25; functional outcome scores and complications from each group were compared. It would be better if authors compare functional outcome scores and complications rate of patients with normal weight with the cohorts of different BMIs. There are many database studies published in last a few years, the authors should cite similar studies and discuss findings from other studies.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24932

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcome in primary total knee arthroplasty - a single institution analysis of 2180 primary total knee replacements

Reviewer's code: 03510801

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-16 17:04

Date reviewed: 2016-03-12 17:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting and nicely written paper. some concerns: in the result section it is unclear whether or not the different complications rate between groups reach statistical significance; this must be clearly stated in the result section; I mean this is probably beyond the scopes of this study, and I know that 25 is the currently worldwide used threshold to distinguish between normal and overweight patients, however I think it would be very interesting to assess differences especially in complications rate between obese (>30 BMI) and non-obese (less or equal than 30 BMI) patients. This could be resumed in an additional table, and sure it would increase the relevance of this study in the clinical practice. On the basis of these additional results, a subsequent additional paragraph will be needed in the discussion section.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 24932

Title: Effect of body mass index on functional outcome in primary total knee arthroplasty - a single institution analysis of 2180 primary total knee replacements

Reviewer's code: 01200726

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-16 17:04

Date reviewed: 2016-03-12 21:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present study assessed the effect of BMI on functional outcome in primary total knee arthroplasty. The authors concluded that post-operative functional outcome was not influenced by BMI. The authors divided the patients into only two groups: BMI<25 and BMI≥25. It might be better that statistical evaluations would be performed in more than three groups.