

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 21208

**Title:** Induced pluripotent stem cells in cartilage repair

**Reviewer's code:** 02702057

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2015-07-03 18:39

**Date reviewed:** 2015-09-15 02:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read this editorial entitled "Induced Pluripotent Stem Cells in Cartilage Repair" that deals with an important issue of clinical and medical biology. The Editorial is not well formulated and unfortunately the topic has been extensively reviewed in literature, with some different perspectives and backgrounds. I am afraid that the editorial would not add much to the scientific literature in its present form but the topic is extremely important and interesting. There are some major and minor concerns that need to be addressed before recommending publication. Please split the manuscript in introduction, other subsections, discussion and conclusion. Please add some important information regarding the history/background, production, generation, challenges, alternative approaches and ethical issues of induced pluripotent stem cells (also known as iPS cells or iPSCs), to help better readers understand this new possible therapeutic approach. In my opinion, in this editorial the author should deepen and strengthen different recent and relevant aspect of MSC and Stem Cell-Based Therapies to complete better this report. For example I recommend to see the following recent and interesting papers or others and comment them to stay to the study topic. Mesenchymal stem cells in connective tissue engineering and regenerative medicine: applications in



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

cartilage repair and osteoarthritis therapy. *Histol Histopathol* 2009;24:347-66. Multipotent adult stem cells from adipose tissue for musculoskeletal tissue engineering. *Clin Orthop Relat Res* 2010;468:2530-40. Mesenchymal stem cells from adipose tissue which have been differentiated into chondrocytes in three-dimensional culture express lubricin. *Experimental Biology and Medicine*. 2011; 236: 1333-41. Biosynthesis of collagen I, II, RUNX2 and lubricin at different time points of chondrogenic differentiation in a 3D in vitro model of human mesenchymal stem cells derived from adipose tissue. *Acta Histochem*. 2014 Oct;116(8):1407-17. Chondrocyte and Mesenchymal Stem Cell-Based Therapies for Cartilage Repair in Osteoarthritis and Related Orthopaedic Conditions. *Maturitas*. 2014 Jul;78(3):188-98. New perspectives for articular cartilage repair treatment through tissue engineering: A contemporary review. *World J Orthop* 2014;5:80-8. At the end of the introduction, please strengthen the aim and the hypothesis of your editorial. Please add the conclusion section, in this way without this section, the editorial is poor and also the author does not add anything new. Please add more information about the clinical relevance of the use of IPS, some important suggestions for the scientific community and please explain better the rationale of the editorial.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 21208

**Title:** Induced pluripotent stem cells in cartilage repair

**Reviewer's code:** 02446297

**Reviewer's country:** Slovakia

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2015-07-03 18:39

**Date reviewed:** 2015-09-24 14:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author provides brief review focused on utilization of iPSCs in treatment of articular cartilage. Recently, this approach attracted interest of many researchers and clinicians and may significantly contribute to healing of damaged articular cartilage in near future. However, according to my opinion, the author has to discuss in detail techniques of reprogramming cells as well as the impact on their biological properties in respect to potential clinical application.