

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 33239

Title: Systematic review of bone marrow stimulation for osteochondral lesion of talus - evaluation for level and quality of clinical studies

Reviewer's code: 03518304

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-04-21

Date reviewed: 2017-04-26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well done. It deserves publication

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 33239

Title: Systematic review of bone marrow stimulation for osteochondral lesion of talus - evaluation for level and quality of clinical studies

Reviewer's code: 00503929

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-04-21

Date reviewed: 2017-04-29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a timely, objective, well-written, well-conducted systematic review of a topic relevant to the field of orthopaedics. Like many papers in the field, it preferentially focuses on the clinical literature rather than on basic science aspects. As a result, it tells very little of the underlying mechanisms and intrinsic limitations of the bone marrow stimulation technique, and its usefulness depends essentially on the the critical appraisal of the literature on a particular clinical application. I would advise the authors to address the limitations of this approach in the introductory section or in the discussion, so as to make clear to the readers that it is not only limited by the quality of the existing clinical studies guiding its practical use, but is also limited by biological factors. Comprehensive discussions of these issues are to be found in recent publications (J Orthop Surg Res. 2017;12, 39. Goldberg A, Mitchell K, Soans J, Kim L, Zaidi R. The use of mesenchymal stem cells for cartilage repair and regeneration: a systematic review). The underlying biological aspects were previously discussed in a thoughtful review



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

(Injury.2008;39 Suppl 1:S26-31 Steinwachs MR, Gugli T, Kreuz PC. Marrow stimulation techniques.). I suggest to refer to either, or both, in the introductory section of the paper.