

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Dermatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6450

Title: PHOTODYNAMIC THERAPY WITH TOPICAL AMINOLEVULINIC ACID

Reviewer code: 00646537

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 17:55

Date reviewed: 2013-10-30 01:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written and useful review article Would have been nice if you could add more illustrations/figures It would be useful if more detailed protocols for each condition could be mentioned (evidence based) Quite a few spelling errors which need to be corrected

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Dermatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6450

Title: PHOTODYNAMIC THERAPY WITH TOPICAL AMINOLEVULINIC ACID

Reviewer code: 00557058

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 17:55

Date reviewed: 2013-11-02 00:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article by Negosanti et al on photodynamic therapy (PDT) with special emphasis on the use of topical aminolevulinic acid (ALA) is very primitive. This agent has been tested in PDT for several years, and now many new derivatives of ALA have been generated in addition to the development of many new photosensitizers for the use of PDT. It is a primitive and very basic description of PDT with the use of ALA. There is a lot of language problem and need to be fixed by any knowledgeable native English knowing person. In addition, many spelling errors are there throughout the article, such as on page 4, "retine". Reference style need to be checked carefully. Follow uniform pattern. In some references, the name of months are given, which is not required. Table legends: Authors are advised to write in more details the legends of each table. Table 3: Please define here about the A, B, C and D etc. and their significance. What is the meaning of "Quality of evidence" requires explanation briefly here in legend.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Dermatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6450

Title: PHOTODYNAMIC THERAPY WITH TOPICAL AMINOLEVULINIC ACID

Reviewer code: 00646464

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 17:55

Date reviewed: 2013-11-02 22:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Accepted with corrections. A simple, clear and useful review paper on PDT. There is a lack of some references in items: Photochemistry and Aminolevulinic acid. There are many spelling problems throughout the paper, which need correction. It is needed to follow a pattern in references.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Dermatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6450

Title: PHOTODYNAMIC THERAPY WITH TOPICAL AMINOLEVULINIC ACID

Reviewer code: 00646460

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-21 17:55

Date reviewed: 2013-11-06 18:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review article describing the mechanisms of photodynamic therapy and its use in clinical dermatology. There are a few points which need to be clarified. 1) Why are there two different abstracts in the paper? 2) It would be clearer if a diagram can be included illustrating the cellular/molecular mechanisms of photodynamic therapy. 3) The authors state that they have used PDT in over 250 patients affected by actinic keratoses, basal cell carcinomas and Bowen's disease. Do the authors have the efficacy rate data for PDT in their hospital? 4) It would be good if some clinical pictures (before and after PDT treatment) can be included. 5) What is the mechanism of PDT in photorejuvenation? 6) Please consult an English language editor. There are some spelling/grammatical errors in the manuscript, for example: Page 2 line 4, page 3 line 4, page 4 line 2: prophyrin derived (prophyrin derivative) Page 2 line 9, page 4 line 24, page 5 line 2, page 5 line 9: cromophore (chromophore) Page 2 line 10: Since the have been studied other chromophores (Since then there have been studies involving other chromophores) Page 2 line 11: photosensitizersm (photosensitizers) Page 4 line 13: cellular destroying (cellular destruction) Page 4 line 25: instable (unstable) Page 5 line 13: making they photosensitive (making them photosensitive) Page 5 line 20: insight into the cells (entry into the cells) Page 6 line 8: okygen (oxygen) Page 6 line 11: cytochrome C releasing (cytochrome C release) Page 6 line 14: piastrinic aggregation (platelet aggregation) Page 9 line 14: sensibility (sensitivity) Page 11 line 18: currently studying (currently under study) Page 12 line 10: associated to PDT (combined with PDT)