

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

Ms: 2868

Title: Smoking and genital HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece

Reviewer code: 00398493

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-20 13:46

Date reviewed: 2013-03-20 16:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

This paper is interesting and faces with the worldwide problem of HPV infection and co-factors of HPV persistence and progression. I think it could be a good paper for our Journal, even if it has two criticisms: 1) The COBAS? 4800 system was used for HPV DNA testing, who lacks of specific multiple HPV DNA analysis, but has a cocktail result for many HPV types 2) The lack of information on general habits of investigated young women

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

I compliment with the author effort to face with this important topic. The paper is interesting and well written. I encourage authors to continue to explore this issue, improving their analysis with information on general habits of investigated young women and to discover the further correlations with HPV infection/co-infections and other factors, a part smoking.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

Ms: 2868

Title: Smoking and genital HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece

Reviewer code: 00742297

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-20 13:46

Date reviewed: 2013-03-21 02:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

No serious criticisms regarding the paper. Some minor revision. Readers will be interested in this MS.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

1. Please list the primers used for PCR. 2. Please figure out how to control the false positive ratio for PCR. 3. please mark the statistically significant on the Figure 1. 4. Please finish the figure legend for Fig 1.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

Ms: 2868

Title: Smoking and genital HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece

Reviewer code: 00742113

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-20 13:46

Date reviewed: 2013-03-21 05:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

Interesting manuscript, excellent presented, to be published after adding a limitation paragraph before the conclusion.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Interesting manuscript, excellent presented, to be published after adding a limitation paragraph before the conclusion.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

Ms: 2868

Title: Smoking and genital HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece

Reviewer code: 00742250

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-20 13:46

Date reviewed: 2013-03-21 11:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

Dear Editor, This study is enough for both the number of population and the study design. It has a scientific value to be published in World J Obstet Gynecol.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

As the authors mentioned in the text, there are still contradicting reports regarding the association between tobacco use and high-risk HPV infection. The distribution of the HPV types varies according to an area or a country. It is important that the data according to the country like this study are accumulated. This study is enough for both the number of population and the study design. Some grammatical errors are found. Please check them before publication.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

Ms: 2868

Title: Smoking and genital HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece

Reviewer code: 00730309

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-20 13:46

Date reviewed: 2013-03-24 13:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

very good education.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

that topic has been practiced much times. New studies may be helpful for cervical cancer ethiology.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

Ms: 2868

Title: Smoking and genital HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece

Reviewer code: 00742259

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-20 13:46

Date reviewed: 2013-03-24 21:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

CONFIDENTIAL COMMENTS TO EDITOR:

Smoking and HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece by Chatzistamatiou et al. **GENERAL COMMENTS** The importance of the research and the significance of the research contents; Important subject. The novelty and innovation of the research; Limited data thus far. Presentation and readability of the manuscript; Good. Ethics of the research. Patients signed a consent-form to participate. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS** -The aim of the study does not fit with the conclusion. The authors wanted to investigate if smoking influences the course of HPV infection. This suggests a study design with sequential HPV genotyping for the respective patients. In this way, one would be able to study the course of HPV infection. In fact, the authors found an association. -Smoking is regarded as a late effect during cervical carcinogenesis (Louie et al, CEBP 2011). This implies that smoking is not considered as an important factor for persistent HPV infections. The authors found a possible association, but unfortunately, they did not perform HPV genotyping at certain intervals to answer this question. They should comment on this. -It may be important for the readership to have more information about other important co-factors; age at first intercourse, number of sexual partners, oral contraceptive use, etc. This is important, because more information is needed to rule out bias. Is it possible that other risk factors for HPV infection were more prevalent in the young smoking HPV positive age group?

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Smoking and HPV infection in women attending cervical cancer screening in Greece by Chatzistamatiou et al. **GENERAL COMMENTS** The importance of the research and the significance of the research contents; Important subject. The novelty and innovation of the research; Limited data thus far. Presentation and

readability of the manuscript; Good. Ethics of the research. Patients signed a consent-form to participate. SPECIFIC COMMENTS -The aim of the study does not fit with the conclusion. The authors wanted to investigate if smoking influences the course of HPV infection. This suggests a study design with sequential HPV genotyping for the respective patients. In this way, one would be able to study the course of HPV infection. In fact, the authors found an association. -Smoking is regarded as a late effect during cervical carcinogenesis (Louie et al, CEBP 2011). This implies that smoking is not considered as an important factor for persistent HPV infections. The authors found a possible association, but unfortunately, they did not perform HPV genotyping at certain intervals to answer this question. They should comment on this. -It may be important for the readership to have more information about other important co-factors; age at first intercourse, number of sexual partners, oral contraceptive use, etc. This is important, because more information is needed to rule out bias. Is it possible that other risk factors for HPV infection were more prevalent in the young smoking HPV positive age group?