



# Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7339

**Title:** : Study of effect of vaginal speculum lubrication over cervical cytology and discomfort caused in pap smear screening

**Reviewer code:** 00742046

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-14 17:31

**Date reviewed:** 2013-11-15 19:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comment to WJOG 7339 Study of effect of vaginal speculum lubrication over cervical cytology and discomfort caused in pap smear screening This article evaluated the effect of vaginal speculum lubrication with xylocaine gel over cervical cytology and pain scoring in Pap smear screening and concluded that vaginal speculum lubrication with xylocaine gel did not influence the Pap smear screening. I congratulate this successful work. Some comments

1. Many typing errors are present. For example, Pap smear should be used in place of pap smear.
2.  $p < 0.01$  should be used in place of  $p = 0.00$
3. What is "GOPD"? I guess that it is "Gynecologic outpatient clinics". It is not appropriate.
4. The rates of unsatisfactory smears in the no gel group "were" 1.99% and in the gel group "were" 3.31%, respectively, without significantly statistical difference between each other ( $p < 0.05$ ).
5. Please describe the characteristics of the enrolled patients, for example, history of vaginal birth. Is there any woman to have pregnancy during the one-year follow-up? Since the authors wrote that "Women with history of hysterectomy, infectious gynecologic complaints, genital bleeding, cervical cancer, chronic pelvic pain or allergy to gel lubricant were excluded from the study.", besides "loss of follow-up", it is hard to believe that no gynecologic or obstetric conditions happened in these 151 patients. Please explain it.



# Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7339

**Title:** : Study of effect of vaginal speculum lubrication over cervical cytology and discomfort caused in pap smear screening

**Reviewer code:** 00742346

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-14 17:31

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-03 20:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors need to change the title. It should read the effect on not over. The correct grammar is the authors evaluated the effect of lubrication on cytology not over cytology. This should be changed throughout the article.



# Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7339

**Title:** : Study of effect of vaginal speculum lubrication over cervical cytology and discomfort caused in pap smear screening

**Reviewer code:** 00742250

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-14 17:31

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-07 11:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The clinical trial is unique and interesting, although the same trials were performed previously. Comparison of the comfort levels in the same women between dry and gel speculums is a new method. However, there are some concerns to be revised and considered in this study. 1 Title: "Effect of vaginal speculum lubrication on cervical cytology and discomfort during smear examination" is more appropriate. 2 Numerical values of the second decimal place are not necessary. 3 What does "GOPD" in line 76 of page 4 mean? 4 Figure 1 is not necessary. The readers will understand the analyzed population just with description. 5 There are 2 women with HSIL in both groups. Are they the same women or different ones? Was a woman with LISL in the gel group diagnosed with NILM? The authors should describe the details of the cytology results in Result section. 6 Please add standard deviation bars and significance mark in Figure 2. 7 Gilson et al found no significant alteration in patient discomfort with speculum gel lubrication. Hill et al reported that lower pain scores were observed in gel group as compared to speculum lubrication with water. And this study showed a significant better feeling in gel speculum than in dry one. The authors should discuss on the differences. In particular, why did the difference occur between Gilson's study and this study?



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,  
315-321 Lockhart Road,  
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Obstetrics and Gynecology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 7339

**Title:** : Study of effect of vaginal speculum lubrication over cervical cytology and discomfort caused in pap smear screening

**Reviewer code:** 00730309

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-11-14 17:31

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-08 20:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

You should follow up this population for false negative smear results for future.