

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Respiriology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 1755

Title: Seasonal variation and living alone are related to pulmonary rehabilitation non-completion

Reviewer code: 02495521

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-01-04 10:38

Date reviewed: 2013-02-25 21:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Pulmonary rehabilitation is an effective intervention in managing chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD). However, non-completion rates have been reported between 20-30%. It is important to improve the understanding of factors associated with program non-completion to ensure optimal use of this limited health care resource. The study is to identify baseline characteristics that independently predict pulmonary rehabilitation non-completion and compare these findings against the participant's reasons for non-completion. They found that despite winter commencing programs and participants who lived alone being independent predictors of program non-completion, neither measure was reported by participants as a reason for non-completion. There are several questions: The participant's reasons for non-completion should be illustrated in figure. Why there is no relationship between program non-completion in winter and illness as the reason reported for non-completion? A survey consisting of both closed response and open-ended questions was developed by the study's investigators. How about the validity of the questionnaires?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Respiriology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 1755

Title: Seasonal variation and living alone are related to pulmonary rehabilitation non-completion

Reviewer code: 01368001

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-01-04 10:38

Date reviewed: 2013-03-04 13:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1.This is an interesting study to explore the reasons why some participants who joined an 8-week pulmonary rehabilitation program could not complete the course. Authors investigate a total 111 COPD patients and analyzed baseline characteristics. Non-completers also reported their personal and external factors contributed to their non-completion. Authors concluded that despite winter commencing programs and participants who lived alone being independent predictors of program non-completion, neither measure was reported by participants as a reason for non-completion. 2.The manuscript was well prepared and written. However, there are several queries and comments needed to be clarified and revised before acceptance for publication. 3.Major critiques: a.Authors should provide inclusion and exclusion criteria in "Materials and Methods part. How many participants were enrolled initially? How many were excluded during initial survey? 4.Minor critiques: a. Introduction, -- Authors have mentioned in the second paragraph that only Fischer's study had compared the independent factors associated with pulmonary rehabilitation program non-completion against the participant's described reasons for non-completion. Some of their results should be described here in the part. What was the difference? b. Materials and Methods, ---The description "Individuals who failed to attend \geq one session of the pulmonary rehabilitation program were excluded from both study components." in the fifth line from the bottom of paragraph 1 should be given in a more straightforward manner for readers. c.Materials and Methods-Pulmonary rehabilitation program, ---The description "Along with the two supervised...training each week." In the third line from the bottom should be given in a more straightforward manner for readers. Was this one of the reasons why participants could not complete the courses? d. Results, ---" Eleven separate courses were completed with four programs commenced during winter, three during



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

summer, and two each during autumn and spring.”in line 5 of paragraph 1. Please described more clearly about the “eleven separate courses”. ---A higher percentage of non-completers commenced pulmonary rehabilitation during winter (37.8% (17/45)) when compared to the remaining seasons (13.6% (9/66); $p=0.006$).This data should be presented in Table 1. e. Discussion, ---Beginning of the second paragraph,“Participants who lived alone...as the only independent predictors of program non-completion. However, no surveyed participant indicated that living alone was a reason for program non-completion.”There is no further discussion of why this is the case of the results.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Respiriology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 1755

Title: Seasonal variation and living alone are related to pulmonary rehabilitation non-completion

Reviewer code: 02494453

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-01-04 10:38

Date reviewed: 2013-03-09 18:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments: In this study Walsh et al, investigated the reasons for non completion of a rehabilitation program in COPD patients. The results of the study showed that winter commencing program and living alone were the only independent predictors of non completion of the rehab program. The topic of this study is of importance since non-adherence is the major limitation for the rehab programs. Specific comments: Major comments: My major concern for this study is that authors have not included specific questionnaires for evaluation of specific psychological factors such as depression, anxiety disorder, and trait personality ecc. These factors might influence the results and could explain in a significant percentage the non-completion of the rehab program. It is well known that there is a high prevalence of depression in COPD patients in relation to disease severity. Please include in the limitation section and add a paragraph in discussion section discussing their role in non completion of rehabilitation programs. Illness remains one of the most important factors for non completion of a rehabilitation program. Did you analyze separately COPD patients based on severity of COPD (GOLD stages, greater than III versus lower than III?) Minor comments: Introduction section Please state a clear hypothesis in the study based on the current literature Materials and methods The definition of non completion is rather random. Please add the reasons for these definition criteria (references if there are). Information on current treatment is missing. Was there any modification during the rehabilitation program? Please report other co-morbidities present in these patients if there are, that might influence results (CHF, CHD, diabetes ecc.) Results Extensive description of the data is reported from the authors, besides Tables' presentation. Please consider deleting repetitive data.