Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Respirology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7017
Title: "A phase II trial of adjuvant chemotherapy with tri-weekly carboplatin plus docetaxel in patients with completely resected non-small cell lung cancer
Reviewer code: 02499200
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 19:38
Date reviewed: 2013-11-17 07:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
This is an article showing the results of adjuvant chemotherapy in a two-stage multi-center phase II study. The study concludes that adjuvant chemotherapy with CBDCA AND DTX is useful and has an acceptable toxicity. It is a descriptive work in a single arm of 67 patients with a well designed and implemented methodology (inclusion and exclusion criteria, pretreatment and treatment schedule). Statistical analysis is correct. The main limitation of this study, as the authors pointed out, is the short number of patients included. This is nevertheless an interesting work demonstrating the feasibility of this adjuvant chemotherapy treatment in patients with NSCLC.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Respirology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7017
Title: "A phase II trial of adjuvant chemotherapy with tri-weekly carboplatin plus docetaxel in patients with completely resected non-small cell lung cancer
Reviewer code: 00061154
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 19:38
Date reviewed: 2013-11-22 01:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[Y]Rejection
[Y] Grade D (Fair)	[Y] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
1. Please explain why only 3 courses of adjuvant chemo were given. The standard number of adjuvant courses is 4. 2. Grade 4 neutropenia of 66% is excessive. This is even more than your grade 3. Is this a mistake? If so, this would explain the rare neutropenic faver.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Respirology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7017
Title: "A phase II trial of adjuvant chemotherapy with tri-weekly carboplatin plus docetaxel in patients with completely resected non-small cell lung cancer
Reviewer code: 02499736
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 19:38
Date reviewed: 2013-12-31 15:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
Good work on an important topic. I have only one major comment for your study -Although comliance rate is not bad, still grade 3/4 neutropenia rate is very high. Also we should consider that these are completly resected patients. I would not call this regimen as showing "acceptable toxicity". Please revise accordingly

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Respirology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 7017
Title: "A phase II trial of adjuvant chemotherapy with tri-weekly carboplatin plus docetaxel in patients with completely resected non-small cell lung cancer
Reviewer code: 02497150
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-11-14 19:38
Date reviewed: 2013-12-31 16:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
Dear Authors: This is a well conducted phase II study for adjuvant lung cancer treatment though the case number is small. The choice and dose of docetaxol and carboplatin is reasonable for the purpose. The application of G-CSF can be considered in future study because of frequent Grade 3 and grade 4 neutropenia. The 6 th edition pathology stage can be omitted in table 1 because the old staging is no longer used. In table 3,the incidence of peripheral neuropathy should be provided.