

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Pediatrics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24519

**Title:** Skin disease and thyroid autoimmunity in atopic South Italian children

**Reviewer's code:** 02446483

**Reviewer's country:** Canada

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-26 14:13

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-27 05:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting manuscript with the aim to verify the prevalence of thyroid autoimmunity and the possible association with atopy in a restricted population showing skin disease. I agree that this may be the first report showing a significant prevalence of TA in a population of atopic children affected by skin disease. However, a few aspects need to be tackled. 1) The bias of selecting population should be emphasized and cannot be marginalized at the end. It needs more discussion and comparison with other studies with atopy and other diseases. 2) IgA deficiency and celiac disease screening as well as a pediatric GI nutritional status should be added. 3) Moreover, it may be important to cite works in PubMed between atopy and cancer, not only thyroid cancer. This may be important for the surveillance of these patients. 4) Some misspellings and Grammar errors are present, but overall the manuscript is readable.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Pediatrics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24519

**Title:** Skin disease and thyroid autoimmunity in atopic South Italian children

**Reviewer's code:** 00646569

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-26 14:13

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-30 02:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is interesting and enhancing your previous research results. There are many minor English language errors that needs to be edited by a native English speaker. Pleas provide specialities of the authors, are all they surgeons as the name of the department is "surgery". Additionally please provide the criteria for definition of atopy. The reader could get confused without knowing the criteria of atopy you used in your study.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Pediatrics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24519

**Title:** Skin disease and thyroid autoimmunity in atopic South Italian children

**Reviewer's code:** 00646519

**Reviewer's country:** Mexico

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-26 14:13

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-10 03:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting paper about Thyroid Autoimmunity in Atopic South Italian Children. These are my comments. Before mentioning an abbreviation it should be defined (TA in abstract). Demographical data should be included (some allergies, onset of symptoms or disease, evolution time, etc.) Some phrases are ambiguous and must be rewritten i.e. "In a recent study conducted in a Mediterranean area (Almeria, Spain), the prevalence of TA was higher and reached 3.7% in children and adolescents": in what kind of patients it was performed?. A comparative analysis between the data of the present paper with the literature must be done. The conclusion of AA and TA is difficult to support due to small number of patient (n=2). Please, add a final phrase indicating the specifically findings in the population analyzed. English needs to be polished.