

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Urology

ESPS manuscript NO: 10095

Title: Programmed Cell Death Protein 4 (Pdc4) expression in renal cell carcinoma, penile carcinoma and testicular germ cell cancer

Reviewer code: 00030987

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-03-13 08:09

Date reviewed: 2014-03-13 14:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have read very carefully the manuscript. I think the topic is very interesting. The introduction of appropriate length. The section of Materials and Methods is adequate. The representation of the results is satisfactory. The discussion is not appropriate length. I think that could be shortened.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Urology

ESPS manuscript NO: 10095

Title: Programmed Cell Death Protein 4 (Pdcd4) expression in renal cell carcinoma, penile carcinoma and testicular germ cell cancer

Reviewer code: 02268942

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-03-13 08:09

Date reviewed: 2014-03-25 03:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Fisher et al. is to investigate the Pdcd4 expression in renal cell carcinoma, penile carcinoma, and testicular germ cell cancer. The authors found that the Pdcd4 is strongly expressed in core and cytoplasm, but core and cytoplasmic Pdcd4 levels is significantly decreased in the cancer tissues. These findings are important and may reveal a novel biomarker for renal and prostate cancers. However, the clinical importance of Pdcd4 is unclear if there is no investigation into the relationship between Pdcd4 expression and survival rate of renal cell carcinoma, penile carcinoma, and testicular germ cell cancer. Other minor concerns: 1. Several typos occur in the manuscript, which needs to be corrected. 2. Authors need to add a brief introduction of human renal, penile, and testicular cancers. 3. Authors need to provide represented figures of IHC staining. 4. Authors need to define the abbreviations of sRCC, pRCC, ccRCC, and chRCC. Are they different stages of renal cancer. A brief discussion of these will be greatly help for general readers. 5. What is the "core" staining? Is it a nuclear staining? 6. Authors should explain more in detail of the result showed in Table1 to Table 4. 7. Define NSGCT!!