

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Urology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22543

Title: Adjuvant radiotherapy for pathologically advanced prostate cancer improves biochemical recurrence free survival compared to salvage radiotherapy

Reviewer's code: 00505643

Reviewer's country: Israel

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-09-08 09:38

Date reviewed: 2015-09-15 14:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor The authors compared retrospectively the results of adjuvant and salvage radiotherapy after radical prostatectomy. They found that patients in the adjuvant group had better biochemical recurrence-free survival but no other benefit. Comments: 1. The authors should define "undetectable PSA". 2. Median follow-up (53 months) is too short. With longer follow-up other benefits of the adjuvant treatment may come-up. 3. There is no mention of side effects, not even in the discussion. To be clinically relevant this issue cannot be ignored. 4. Since the study is retrospective, it is subjected to selection bias. Yet this bias would probably favor the salvage group.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Urology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22543

Title: Adjuvant radiotherapy for pathologically advanced prostate cancer improves biochemical recurrence free survival compared to salvage radiotherapy

Reviewer's code: 00504183

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-09-08 09:38

Date reviewed: 2015-09-20 08:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting retrospective study comparing the effects of adjuvant vs. salvage RT on biochemical recurrence free survival of high risk PCa pts with initially undetectable post-op PSA. This is well-written work and both the results and limitations of the study are adequately documented.