

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology

ESPS manuscript NO: 10385

Title: Transgenic plants for allergen-specific immunotherapy

Reviewer code: 02618027

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-03-31 14:41

Date reviewed: 2014-04-08 09:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors propose rice seed-based oral immunotherapy to mitigate the challenges and negative effects of current methods of allergic immunotherapies. This is an excellent study showing the benefits of using transgenic rice containing Japanese cedar pollen or house dust mites to ameliorate allergic rhinitis and bronchial asthma. The authors purport the novel potential of using these transgenic rice seeds as allergic immunotherapies in mouse models and patient populations. The concepts presented herein provide significant contributions to the developing field of immunotherapy. Below are a few comments: Major Comments: Greater amounts of allergen (200 times larger than SCIT) which are required to induce immune tolerance by oral IT may have impaired clearance of secondary bacterial infections that can occur when immune function or inflammatory response is suppressed. The reviewers should comment on the potential of such events in the discussion of their conclusions. Minor Comments: In the Abstract and first paragraph of the Introduction, there are a few grammatical errors which should be corrected.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology

ESPS manuscript NO: 10385

Title: Transgenic plants for allergen-specific immunotherapy

Reviewer code: 00664488

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-03-31 14:41

Date reviewed: 2014-04-10 00:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript has nicely summarized the recent progress in the area of allergen-specific immunotherapy, particularly on the transgenic plant approach. Allergic diseases are becoming more common in many developed and some developing countries. It is still difficult to find an effective way to treat and cure these diseases. Rice-based oral immunotherapy has showed some promises. The authors described their interesting works on the generation and characterization of transgenic rice seeds expressing allergens of Japanese cedar pollen and house dust mite. The data have indicated a possible alternative to many immunotherapies currently on trial. The manuscript was well written. Nevertheless, this reviewer suggests the following corrections: 1) In the Introduction section, the first sentence, "westernized" can be substituted by "industrialized". 2)Page 6, the "Oral Immunotherapy for Allergic Diseases" section, line 11 from top of the paragraph, "of" is missing between "the amount" and "allergen required". 3)Page 7, the "Rice Seed as an Allergen Carrier" section, line 10 from top of the paragraph, "they are" at the beginning of the line can be deleted.