BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology
ESPS manuscript NO: 20848
Title: Chimeric antigen receptors – on the road to realising their full potential
Reviewer's code: 00212189
Reviewer's country: Norway
Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong
Date sent for review: 2015-06-24 14:32
Date reviewed: 2015-07-04 02:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this well-written editorial, the authors present a very interesting review on a novel technology for immunotherapy, namely chimeric antigen receptors (CARS). Specific comments: 1) Page 3. Some references would be appropriate for the 2 signal requirement for T-cell activation, e.g. Bretscher & Cohn Science 1970 (PMID:4194660) 2) How does CAR technology compare to immunotherapy mediated by monoclonal antibodies against the same target, e.g. anti-CD19 antibodies? A few considerations about this issue would be useful to the critical reader. 3) Page 7. "Consequently, self-antigens are generally selected for CAR T cell immunotherapy in the hope that on-target toxicity will not emerge upon clinical testing." This sentence is paradoxical and requires further explanations. Targeting self antigens is expected to cause toxicity!

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology
ESPS manuscript NO: 20848
Title: Chimeric antigen receptors – on the road to realising their full potential
Reviewer's code: 00502947
Reviewer's country: Australia
Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong
Date sent for review: 2015-06-24 14:32
Date reviewed: 2015-07-05 20:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A clearly written and enjoyable to read expert editorial on CARs. The different issues are appropriately covered and this includes the quality control of the technology. The arguments are well balance. I thought that the work in two other recent June publications could be mentioned. This includes use in T cell malignancies: Mamonkin M et al. A T cell-directed chimeric antigen receptor for the selective treatment of T cell malignancies. Blood. 2015 Jun 8. pii: blood-2015-02-629527. [Epub ahead of print] Also some work on overcoming the cytokine toxicity Song DG et al. A fully human chimeric antigen receptor with potent activity against cancer cells but reduced risk for off-tumor toxicity. Oncotarget. 2015 Jun 19. [Epub ahead of print]

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology
ESPS manuscript NO: 20848
Title: Chimeric antigen receptors – on the road to realising their full potential
Reviewer's code: 00502977
Reviewer's country: France
Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong
Date sent for review: 2015-06-24 14:32
Date reviewed: 2015-06-28 21:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments: the authors provide a review related to chimeric antigen receptors (CAR). This excellent and up to date review article will provide much recent knowledge concerning CAR to the readers of this journal. In the manuscript, authors refer to therapeutic trials and adverse events, however, these issues are not sufficiently discussed and a table summarizing these specific points would help the readers.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology
ESPS manuscript NO: 20848
Title: Chimeric antigen receptors – on the road to realising their full potential
Reviewer's code: 00503125
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong
Date sent for review: 2015-06-24 14:32
Date reviewed: 2015-06-29 04:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Chimeric antigen receptors are fusion molecules that may be genetically delivered to T-cells thereby conferring specificity for target antigens on the surface of the tumor. This approach has had some success with elimination of B-cell malignancies. The efficacy of this approach to sold tumors remains poorly defined. Manufacture of the critical molecules and target selection remains a challenge. A nice review of the status of the application of chimeric antigen receptors to tumor biology is outlined in this manuscript.