



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21378

Title: Essential vitamins for an effective T cell response

Reviewer's code: 00505825

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-14 09:11

Date reviewed: 2015-07-21 14:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review of Goswami R And Kaplan MH discusses the main mechanisms through vitamins D and A regulates immune response, mainly T cell response. The manuscript is a clearly written and comprehensive review which collect the main findings regarding the role of vitamins D and A in the regulation of the different T cell subsets, how this has impact in allergy and autoimmune diseases, as well as the clinical applications of vitamins D and A. The reference list is complete and useful for reader who want to deep in this interesting issue. Perhaps, apart from the final section 'Conclusions' the authors should lay emphasis on those aspects that they consider of special relevance manly for those readers outside this very interesting field.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Immunology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21378

Title: Essential vitamins for an effective T cell response

Reviewer’s code: 03089290

Reviewer’s country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-14 09:11

Date reviewed: 2015-08-15 04:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Several studies have linked deficiencies in vitamin D to increased susceptibility to immune-mediated disorders, including chronic infections and autoimmune diseases. In addition, vitamin A, through its active derivative retinoic acid (RA), has been shown to play an essential role in Th1 responses in allograft rejection, vaccination, and gut infection. Therefore, this comprehensive review is focused on the roles of vitamin A and vitamin D on CD4 T cell subsets. The authors outline vitamin A & D synthesis, signaling, and discuss known polymorphisms. Then the authors discuss how these vitamins modulate signaling in T cells, and the roles of vitamins in allergy and autoimmunity. Overall, this is a nicely written review that provides an overview of the field and provides potential clinical applications and future directions. Minor issues: 1. Recently, several similar reviews have been published. The manuscript herein is novel in scope, but some of the more recent literature could be included as in the articles listed below: 1. Seeing through the dark: New insights into the immune regulatory functions of vitamin A. Brown CC, Noelle RJ. Eur J Immunol. 2015 May;45(5):1287-95. 2. Immune Modulation by Vitamin D and Its Relevance to Food Allergy. Suaini NH, Zhang Y, Vuillermin PJ, Allen KJ, Harrison LC. Nutrients. 2015 Jul 27;7(8):6088-108. 3.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Vitamin D and 1,25(OH)₂D regulation of T cells. Cantorna MT, Snyder L, Lin YD, Yang L. *Nutrients*. 2015 Apr 22;7(4):3011-21. doi: 10.3390/nu7043011. 4. Vitamin D Actions on CD4(+) T Cells in Autoimmune Disease. Hayes CE, Hubler SL, Moore JR, Barta LE, Praska CE, Nashold FE. *Front Immunol*. 2015 Mar 18;6:100. 2. Minor proofreading/ editing is needed. For example: 1. p3 "The presence of a structurally conserved an α -helical ligand-binding domain (LBD) and a DNA binding domains (is) the..." 2. p7 "Vitamin D supplementation is associated with increased percentage of Treg cells in healthy individuals in circulating CD4+ T cells [136]" 3. p8 "The atRA-mediated inhibition of Th17 cells is independent of IL- γ - 2, STAT3 and STAT5 to overcome the effect of IL-6; however some initial IL - 2 signaling may be required for the regulatory function [179, 180]." 4. p9 "CTLA-4, part of the T-cell co-stimulatory signal, differentially regulating ERK signaling pathway and required by TGF- β to generate CD4+CD25+ Tregs is induced by atRA [188-190]"