



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 28728

Title: Intravenous vitamin C as adjunctive therapy for enterovirus/rhinovirus induced acute respiratory distress syndrome

Reviewer's code: 00502871

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-13 14:35

Date reviewed: 2016-07-22 04:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The case report documents severe respiratory failure in a 20 year old who received vitamin c and had remarkable recovery. A cause and effect relationship is difficult to prove with a single case report; nonetheless, it could be a preliminary report and the basis for a larger randomized trial.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 28728

Title: Intravenous vitamin C as adjunctive therapy for enterovirus/rhinovirus induced acute respiratory distress syndrome

Reviewer's code: 00502932

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-13 14:35

Date reviewed: 2016-08-01 07:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting, but anecdotal, report of use of high dose intravenous Vitamin C in ARDS. - In the abstract, under conclusions, the statement that the treatment 'resulted in rapid resolution of lung injury' is too definitive for a single case report, and could probably be better phrased 'was associated with' or some other wording. - In the description of the case report, the daily I & O balances for the first few days on ECMO would be helpful, as the rapidity of clearing of the chest x-ray is striking between Day 1 and Day2 on ECMO, and one wonders if diuresis played a role. - In Conclusions, it should be discussed that this is a single case report, that the role of Vitamin C in this patient's recovery is not certain, and perhaps that additional investigation will be necessary before this can be recommended as a therapy for ARDS.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 28728

Title: Intravenous vitamin C as adjunctive therapy for enterovirus/rhinovirus induced acute respiratory distress syndrome

Reviewer's code: 00502743

Reviewer's country: Argentina

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-13 14:35

Date reviewed: 2016-08-27 07:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Although the presentation case of only a single case, I think it is more than helpful from the medical point of view. This is a specific case of Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome induced by Enterovirus/Rhinovirus, with both methodologically and therapeutically impeccable evolution, as it can be seen in its radiographic progression. The semiotic paradigm is one of the canonical forms of scientific thought that allows to authorize the progression of medical knowledge from particular deductions to general applications. It must be considered the above distinction for this work and its useful effectiveness proposed by their authors.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 28728

Title: Intravenous vitamin C as adjunctive therapy for enterovirus/rhinovirus induced acute respiratory distress syndrome

Reviewer's code: 00502781

Reviewer's country: Finland

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-13 14:35

Date reviewed: 2016-09-09 16:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Fowler et al. report the use of high dose intravenous vitamin C as an adjunctive interventional therapy for acute respiratory distress syndrome (ARDS) resulting from enterovirus/rhinovirus respiratory infection. The patient had severe hypoxemia and hypercapnia, and dense bilateral opacities with central air bronchograms. Due to failure of mechanical ventilation support, extracorporeal membrane oxygenation was initiated. High-dose intravenous vitamin C infusion (200mg/kg/24 hours) improved lung gas exchange and reduced lung opacities. The patient was discharged home 12 days following hospitalization with no long-term ARDS sequelae. Major comments: The authors should specify the viral respiratory panel used for enterovirus/rhinovirus detection. The plasma levels of ascorbic acid during the hospitalization should have been determined. Which was the rationale for reduction of vitamin C dosing? The effects of vitamin C infusion on markers of disease severity could have been assessed.