

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 28421

Title: Female gonadal hormone effects on microglial activation and functional outcomes in a mouse model of moderate traumatic brain injury

Reviewer's code: 02446061

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-07-01 19:24

Date reviewed: 2016-07-19 09:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors: The manuscript is interesting. However, I suggest addition of some data before to consider it to be published in WJA. a) Several recent articles describe the role of hormones on the traumatic brain in mice models. Please add some of these. b) You should be specific on the number of animals used in your experiments. Why only 5 OVX was used for behavior evaluation? c) You should add the strategy to design your experiments in order to minimize suffering and numbers of animals. d) The results are poorly discussed regarding the comparison with similar (murine) models of trauma (and results from these studies). The discussion is centered in the traslational medicine. e) Conclusions are partially supported for results and discussion. A improved presentation of results (comparison among groups) and a deeper discussion could let us to consider the manuscript for publishing. Regards, Reviewer

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Critical Care Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 28421

Title: Female gonadal hormone effects on microglial activation and functional outcomes in a mouse model of moderate traumatic brain injury

Reviewer's code: 00220901

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-07-01 19:24

Date reviewed: 2016-07-24 21:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Female gonadal hormone effects on microglial activation and functional outcomes in a mouse model of moderate traumatic brain injury" is well-written and the study is well designed. The subject is original, important and clinically relevant. I have only minor comment as follows: 1. In discussion section, it would be better adding a paragraph regarding the effects of TBI induced pituitary dysfunction, which could be a potential confounding factor for the results. Clinical and experimental studies clearly demonstrated that 10 to 50 % of patients develop hypopituitarism during acute and chronic TBI including all severities (Tanriverdi F et. al. Endocrine Reviews, June 2015, 36(3):305-342). Gonadotropin deficiency (FSH/LH deficiency finally results in decreased estrogen and progesterone) is one of the most common pituitary hormone deficiencies especially during acute phase of TBI. This factor may also explain the heterogeneity in the outcome after TBI in young female rats.