

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2616

Title: EXPRESSION OF MATRIX METALLOPROTEINASES 9 AND 12 IN ACTINIC CHEILITIS

Reviewer code: 00069481

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-03-05 08:42

Date reviewed: 2013-03-12 16:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors investigated the role of matrix-degrading metalloproteinases 9, 12 (MMPs) in actinic cheilitis. However, there are several concerns in the manuscript. Major concerns: 1. In Fig.2, anti-MMP-9 antibody showed a weak reaction in actinic cheilitis lesions. The authors indicate that positive expression of MMP-9 was detected in actinic cheilitis lesions with no differences in the pattern of expression in comparison with squamous cell carcinomas [Hernandez-Perez M and El-hajahmad M, et al., 2012]. However, these results in the study do not give us a strong evidence to illustrate that MMP-9 is not affected in actinic cheilitis. Furthermore, there are still other ways to determine the difference of MMP-9 between actinic cheilitis lesions and normal tissue. Northern blotting [Yoshihiro Ohnishi and Shingo Tajima, et al., 2000] and gelatin zymographic assay [Patricia A.M. Snoek-van Beurden and Johannes W. Von den Hoff, 2005] would be good tools to investigate the expression of MMP-9, for instance. Immunohistochemistry data in the study seem not be enough to convince of the effect of MMP-9 in actinic cheilitis. Minor concerns: 1. On page 4, line 5, "mRNA and protein" should be "mRNA and protein". 2. On page 4, line 12, "degradation of (BM) components" should be "degradation of BM components". 3. On page 4, line 13, "Furthermore , MMP-12 expression" should be "Furthermore, MMP-12 expression". 4. On page 5, line 8, "5µm thick sections" should be "5 µm thick sections". 5. On page 7, line 5, "Varying degress" should be "Varying degrees". 6. On page 7, line 14, "neutrophils(Fig 2).," should be "neutrophils (Fig 2).". 7. Typing in this manuscript should be more careful. There are many double spaces between words in several sentences.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

Second round peer review:

In this revised manuscript, the authors supplied additional information about demographic data of patients with actinic cheilitis and their histopathological characteristics. These data give us insight into the properties of actinic cheilitis and its related factors. Furthermore, immunostaining of MMP-9 and MMP-12 in normal lower lip specimen provide us a comparable basis of negative control, thus we can recognize the presence of MMP-9 and MMP-12 more clearly. Basically the structure of this revision fits with the suggestions of the editor. Accordingly, the quality of the work described is adequate to accept in the current format.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2616

Title: EXPRESSION OF MATRIX METALLOPROTEINASES 9 AND 12 IN ACTINIC CHEILITIS

Reviewer code: 00570326

Science editor: Song, Xiu-Xia

Date sent for review: 2013-03-05 08:42

Date reviewed: 2013-04-16 01:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Poulopoulos et al. examined the differences in MMP-9 and MMP-12 expression in actinic cheilitis vs. normal lip. I have some major concerns regarding this manuscript: 1.The demographic information of the patients needs to be included, as well as their habits of sun exposure, smoking and drinking. 2.Histopathological information of the samples should be given in detail, and the number and grade of dysplasia in the samples stated. In addition, other alterations should be informed such as epithelial hyperkeratosis, atrophy, acanthosis, and connective tissue inflammation and elastosis 3.The results are very general, figure legends are incomplete and the photographs should show representative microphotographs of MMP-9 and MMP-12 detection both from actinic cheilitis and normal lip, and also a negative control, since the immunostaining for both MMP-9 and MMP-12 does not look very specific. Therefore, it is hard to draw conclusions from the presented results. 4.A previous study on MMP-9 and actinic cheilitis by Souza-Freitas (OOOOE, 2011 112:342-348) should be added in the discussion. 5.There are some minor grammatical and typographical errors that should be corrected.