

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 31579

Title: Discernment scheme for paraquat poisoning: A five-year experience in Shiraz, Iran

Reviewer's code: 01206087

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-11-28 17:57

Date reviewed: 2016-12-02 07:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In spite of the lack of new information, experiences of large numbers of poisoning is worth to be published.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Experimental Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 31579

Title: Discernment scheme for paraquat poisoning: A five-year experience in Shiraz, Iran

Reviewer's code: 02474355

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-11-28 17:57

Date reviewed: 2016-12-04 03:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Kavousi-Gharbi et al. from Shiraz University of Medical Sciences, Shiraz, Iran investigated cross-sectionally the information about all cases of acute poisoning by the herbicide paraquat (1,1'-dimethyl-4,4' bipyridinium dichloride) admitted to 3 main teaching hospitals of Shiraz University in a 5 year period (Sep. 2010 to Sep. 2015). A total of 104 patients (66% male) with a mean age 26±11 years were evaluated. The mortality rate was 43%. Despite the necessity of emergency hemodialysis in first 6 hours of intoxication, none of the patients had dialysis during this time. Immunosuppressive and corticosteroid medications were not administrated with adequate dosage in 31% and 60% of the patients respectively. Ingestion of more than 22 cc of paraquat and increase in creatinine level were the most important predictors of mortality Please correct at page 11: "...patients in this study were NOT treated by hemodialysis due to the lack of facilities." And accord the following sentences. Clearly, also considering the young age of both women and men, the largest majority intended to commit suicide. This point should be stressed also in the Abstract and not just as a short sentence in Discussion. I was surprised that no cardiovascular elements were considered. Was it possible that ECGs were not recorded ? Any arrhythmia ? Please along these lines



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

comment 2 recent articles: Cardiovasc Toxicol 2015; 15: 117-126 and Cardiovasc Toxicol 2015; 15: 324-335. Explain whether glyphosate is not present in Iran and therefore for suicidal attempts agricultural workers “just” rely on paraquat.