

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4739

Title: Role of inflammation and immune activation in the pathogenesis of HIV-1 disease

Reviewer code: 00202286

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 19:12

Date reviewed: 2013-08-06 08:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is well written and examines the role of immune activation and inflammation in HIV-1 disease. The MS is clearly organized with numerous adequate references. There are only few typos. For example: Abstract: A dot is missing after "immunosenescence" Introduction. Last paragraph: A dot is missing after "process"

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4739

Title: Role of inflammation and immune activation in the pathogenesis of HIV-1 disease

Reviewer code: 00759352

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-07-22 19:12

Date reviewed: 2013-08-20 16:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present manuscript reviews the current knowledge on inflammation and immune activation in the pathogenesis and progression of HIV-1 disease. It focuses on microbial translocation, residual viremia and immune senescence, which should appear in the title. An alternative proposed title could be: "Role of microbial translocation, residual viremia and immune senescence in inflammation and immune activation in HIV-1 disease". It needs some revision. The paper is well structured but needs a figure and a table to ease its reading, too tough with only words. There is some confusion in some statements made by the authors. Page 4. Cancers, kidney failure, neurocognitive impairment and a more rapid progression of hep C infection have not been related to long-term antiretroviral treatment (ART). At the contrary, the progression of hep C is actually slowed down by ART. Cancers and neurocognitive impairment are clearly related to HIV-1 and inflammation, not to ART. Finally, some kidney diseases (mainly tubular diseases) are clearly related to ART, but kidney failure is really uncommon. This should be clarified. Page 9. The standard endpoint PCR uses a detection limit of 20 to 50 copies/mL, not 400 c/mL. Please correct. Page 8 Clearly MT is not the only cause (if at all) of immune activation. The authors might wish to change "represent the cause of" by "contribute to". Regarding the studies investigating the intensification with RAL in subjects with suppressed viremia, the authors might wish to cite and comment on Llibre et al (Antiv Ther 2012; 17:355-364). Page 10. When reviewing elite controllers, the authors should cite Chun JID 2013 doi: 10.1093/infdis/jit306, showing that the size of the pool of CD4+ T cells harboring infectious HIV diminished significantly following initiation of ART and rebounded to baseline upon cessation of therapy in elite controllers. There are some English language typos that should be corrected. The word biased (page 4) should be substituted for "decreased". Page 12, the conclusion must be corrected. In its current form its not a conclusion of the article.