

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

ESPS manuscript NO: 29765

Title: Is it enough to eliminate hepatitis C virus to reverse the damage caused by the infection?

Reviewer's code: 00503052

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-27 23:19

Date reviewed: 2016-09-08 17:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting paper concerning the possible role of gut microbiota in HCV related extra hepatic manifestations. Even if there are no experimental data the manuscript reviews very well the state of art of GM and liver and focuses on possible areas that still need to be explored.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

ESPS manuscript NO: 29765

Title: Is it enough to eliminate hepatitis C virus to reverse the damage caused by the infection?

Reviewer's code: 00051373

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-27 23:19

Date reviewed: 2016-10-12 22:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A very interesting editorial written about gut-liver axis regarding hepatitis C virus infection. It should benefit to most of our readers.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Infectious Diseases

ESPS manuscript NO: 29765

Title: Is it enough to eliminate hepatitis C virus to reverse the damage caused by the infection?

Reviewer's code: 02861401

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-27 23:19

Date reviewed: 2016-10-25 12:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper written in an editorial format generates an interesting hypothesis that a successful treatment of HCV infection may provide a complete restoration of GM composition and therefore can further avoid activation of the mucosal immune system, persistent inflammation and the development of different long-term complications. The authors provided some theoretical discussion for their hypothesis based on "gut-liver axis", although solid evidence is not available at this stage. The reviewer agrees with the authors that a deep evaluation of the short, medium and long-term consequences of the new HCV treatments is needed, specially focused on the effects on GM composition, bacterial translocation and inflammation. To improve the readability of this paper, more details or references might be needed, e.g., for the following 1) Details or references for changes in GM composition is associated with plenty disorders, including liver disorders. 2) Details or references for transferring of molecules associated with the gut microbiome to the liver and on the other way round. 3) Evidence/references that the composition of the intestinal microbiota could have direct and indirect effects on the function and physiology of the liver and possibly liver disease



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

progression. 4) Evidence/references that several liver products could directly influence the GM composition. 5) Details or references for those studies that have demonstrated both qualitative and quantitative changes in the composition of the GM in patients with cirrhosis. 6) Evidence/references that preservation of gut microbiote composition arises as a promising tool to prevent and/or to treat the development of these liver disorders. 7) Also, the sentence, "In 2011, the arrival of first-generation direct-acting antivirals has shown successful rates of virus elimination from the body in more than 95% of the cases.", is not accurate. The first-generation of DAA has only ~75% SVR.