BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Pharmacology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12204
Title: Potential ability of xanthophylls for preventing cancer
Reviewer code: 02445225
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-06-28 18:02
Date reviewed: 2014-08-12 16:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Phytochemicals are interesting candidates for the prevention of of obesity and cancer. While there is some supportive evidence for the relevance phytochemicals derived from the fact that humans adhering to traditional Asian or mediterranean food patterns suffer less from obesity, there is very little evidence with respect to specific phytochemicals. In that context the review of the potential role of astaxanthin, ?-crypotxanthin,fucoxanthin and neoxanthin is very valuable. I find the respective chapters about distribution, nature and safety profile very informative. What needs to be considerably improved is the reporting of the preclinical and clinical studies. As this is a controversial field, the reader needs a critical view of the information to be able to assess the quality of the research.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Pharmacology
ESPS manuscript NO: 12204
Title: Potential ability of xanthophylls for preventing cancer
Reviewer code: 00040410
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-06-28 18:02
Date reviewed: 2014-08-30 04:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall the review is packed with information an at times difficult to read. At times the link with obesity and inflammation is missing 1) Preclinical studies and anti-cancer mechanisms of astaxanthin: As this is a review for non experts the correlation between PPAR, obesity and carcinogenesis and between nrf2 and PPAR should be briefly elucidated 2) Fucoxanthin Distribution and nature of fucoxanthin. "but we would like to take a light" = focus 3) To find new cancer prevention approaches, we investigated the combination effect of FuOH and 1?,25-dihydroxyvitamin D3 (1?,25(OH)2D3), and found inhibition of cell viability and induction of apoptosis in DLD-1 and HT-29 cells[93].: Could not find this publication. PPAR is usually inversely related di carcinogenesis 4) Of note, it has been demonstrated that increased plasma levels of GGT are associated with an increased risk of pancreatic cancer[99,100].: This sentence is misleading, GGT has no causative role itself 5) Thus, uPA, PAI-1and uPAR might be used as potential tumor markers for mammary cancer[105], and FX may reduce such a tumor marker.: This is not correct, they may be used as prognostic markers not as precancerous markers