

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 15355

Title: Is lithium potentially a trace element?

Reviewer's code: 02445209

Reviewer's country: Czech Repoublic

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-11-24 20:27

Date reviewed: 2014-11-25 22:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear author, the content of your Editorial is interesting, but the language should be revised by a native speaker. The reviewer

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 15355

Title: Is lithium potentially a trace element?

Reviewer's code: 02445250

Reviewer's country: Israel

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-11-24 20:27

Date reviewed: 2014-12-10 11:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Reviewer's comments on MS entitled "Is lithium potentially a trace element?" In this paper Prof. Takeshi Terao proposes to include the chemical element Lithium to the list of well-known trace elements, such as Boron, Cobalt, Chromium, Calcium, Copper, Iron, Zinc, etc. He bases his proposal on the observational studies reporting that micro-doses of Lithium have the anti-suicidal, anti-aging and anti-dementia effects. In fact, this suggestion is not a new one. Nutritional studies in mammals show the importance of lithium to health, leading to a suggestion that it be classified an essential trace element with an RDA of 1 mg/day (Schrauzer, 2002). I have only a few critical comments. 1. The definition of trace element used here is the direct citation from the Bowen's Trace Elements in Biochemistry (1966) and therefore the reference is needed. 2. When referring to the important effects of lithium on health, its experimental anti-cancer effects should be mentioned (Huili Li et al., 2014). Likewise, an increased cancer risk in patients with bipolar affective disorder (BarChana et al., 2008) also can be associated with long-term lithium treatment. 3. SIRs should read as Standardized Incidence Ratios. 4. English errors should be corrected (e.g., "...how levels are required..." should read "...what levels are required...").

References BarChana M, Levav I, Lipshitz I, Pugachova I,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Kohn R, Weizman A, Grinshpoon A. Enhanced cancer risk among patients with bipolar disorder. *Journal of Affective Disorders* 2008; 108: 43-48. Bowen HJM. *Trace Elements in Biochemistry*. Academic Press, 1966. Huili Li, Kun Huang, Xinghua Liu, Jinlin Liu, Xiaoming Lu, Kaixiong Tao, Guobin Wang, and Jiliang Wang. Lithium Chloride Suppresses Colorectal Cancer Cell Survival and Proliferation through ROS/GSK-3 β /NF- κ B Signaling Pathway. *Oxidative Medicine and Cellular Longevity* Volume 2014 [<http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2014/241864>] Schrauzer GN. Lithium: Occurrence, dietary intakes, nutritional essentiality. *Journal of the American College of Nutrition* 2002; 21: 14-21.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 15355

Title: Is lithium potentially a trace element?

Reviewer's code: 00489383

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-11-24 20:27

Date reviewed: 2014-12-11 21:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting editorial aiming to summarize the role of lithium as a potential trace element. The author focus on the putative correlation between lithium levels and occurrence of depression, suicides, and dementia. However, several points require additional elaboration: 1) The author focus on the lithium in the drinking water. What about lithium in the common food products? Which products are reach of lithium? Are there differences between lithium levels in the food between cuisines? Are there any correlations between lithium in the food and mental health? 2) The primary indication of lithium as a CNS drug is bipolar disorder, particularly, the manic episodes. It would be therefore important to address the correlation between lithium as a trace element and mania. 3) Are there any correlations between lithium consumption and schizophrenia and other psychotic illnesses? 4) Potential mechanisms of action of lithium as a CNS drugs should be reminded; 5) In addition to its beneficial effects on the CNS, aversive and side effects lithium should be reminded.