

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 14373

Title: Brain-derived neurotrophic factor levels in first episode of psychosis: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 02445208

Reviewer's country: Colombia

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-01 20:59

Date reviewed: 2014-10-16 01:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting manuscript. Several major and minor issues should be addressed: In Conclusions of Abstract and Discussion sections it should be important to include the need for a future meta-analysis in this topic. Results section should be expanded and part of the Discussion section needs to be moved there. A reference to an original article demonstrating that BDNF protein crosses the blood-brain barrier should be included. There was statistical significance for the difference in sex distribution for the studies that were positive and negative for BDNF reduction? An exploration of the possible effect of sample sizes of included studies should be important. Authors should check coherence between citation numbers in Table 1 and references. For example, the reference 15 in "Yoshimura 2012[15]" corresponds to Sotiropoulou et al 2013. Size effect should be included for the reported changes described in last column of Table 2. Data for BDNF levels in Table 2 should be converted to the same scale (for example ng/ul). It is not clear why in Table 1 and 2 some studies appear as FPE subjects receiving medicaments. For example, Yoshimura 2012 provides BDNF data for "first-episode untreated Japanese schizophrenia patients". Authors should



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

check and correct data for all included studies.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 14373

Title: Brain-derived neurotrophic factor levels in first episode of psychosis: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00340769

Reviewer's country: Afghanistan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-01 20:59

Date reviewed: 2014-11-22 02:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All my comments are included in the enclosed file. The authors should also check all their references. Some references are not cited at the right place.