

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 17486

Title: On the role of impulsivity and decision-making in suicidal behavior

Reviewer's code: 02156774

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-12 08:47

Date reviewed: 2015-03-24 07:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Re: 17486, Is suicidal behavior a question of decision-making? The author(s) proposed a theoretical model that addresses the importance of decision-making in the link between suicide ideation and suicide attempt. Although literatures reported an impaired, or poor decision making among suicide attempters (Jollant et al., 2005, Am J Psychiatry; Bridge et al., 2012, J am Acad Child Adolesc Psychiatry, etc), proposing a model is still important for education and may provide information for future studies. Therefore, I provide some issue for the authors to enhance the quality of this paper: 1. As the authors cited the work from Kahneman and Tversky, and mentioned the heuristic and biased process, that may lead to poor decision making. The link between suicide and heuristic process should be discussed. For example, suicide attempter may have limited mental capacity (as their thought was occupied by negative information) to perform systematic process, that may stop the suicide attempt. 2. In the section "Suicide attempts in light of the concepts of decision-making", the authors reviewed neuro pathway and brain areas that associated with the decision making of suicide. It seems that these areas are associated more with hot executive function, but not the cool executive function. Providing an theory that clarified the role of hot and cool executive functions on suicide,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

may enhance the novelty of this paper. 3. It would be better to clarify some issues as follows: the differences of executive function and decision-making, the relationship inhibition ability and the globe executive function, inhibition vs. Impulsivity trait, etc. Due to those tasks are involved in those abilities as above, doing inference should be cautious. Especially when the authors try to draw the conclusion about relationships among the brain regions, tasks performance, and suicide behaviors. 4. The figure was unclear and needs to do more illustrate. Some pathways did not be explained. Besides, the author mentioned 'Deficits in decision-making may impair people's ability to resolve problems and dilemmas and thus create an accumulation of stressors leading to further pain' which did not match to previous viewpoint.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 17486

Title: On the role of impulsivity and decision-making in suicidal behavior

Reviewer's code: 02445242

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-12 08:47

Date reviewed: 2015-04-04 00:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Though this editorial is on an interesting aspect of suicidal behaviour, it would be better if the authors could clarify some issues: 1. Much of the editorial is on the role of impulsivity in suicide. Perhaps the authors should include the term impulsivity in the title. 2. The authors are right in pointing out that the link between impulsivity and suicide is complex, partly because of the different concepts of the term used. One of the distinctions is between trait impulsivity (or traits of impulsive-aggression) and state impulsivity. The former is more likely to be linked to suicide attempts, while the latter is less likely to be associated with suicide attempts. Impulsivity itself may be a multidimensional concept with dimensions of urgency, lack of perseverance, (3) lack of premeditation, and sensation seeking (Whiteside & Lynam, 2001), which may determine suicidal behaviour differently. 3. Similarly, it is not clear from the editorial whether deficits in decision-making thought to be associated with suicide attempts are trait or state characteristics. 4. Perhaps some mention should be made of the genetics and neurochemistry of impulsivity and suicidal behaviour. 5. The authors need to be clearer about the various terms incorporated in suicidal behaviour. For example, a failed attempt at suicide needs to be distinguished from attempted



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

suicide or deliberate self-harm and completed suicides. The distinction between violent and non-violent failed attempts/completed suicides/ deliberate self-harm also needs to be mentioned. 6. Finally, does suicide always imply a deficit in decision making ('bad decisions'), or can they be a rational choice ('right decisions' in a way) in the face of a seemingly insurmountable problem? The latter is implied in some of the theories quoted by the authors.