

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 20933

Title: Poor CD4 count is a predictor of untreated depression in human immunodeficiency virus-positive African-Americans

Reviewer's code: 02445225

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-09 09:52

Date reviewed: 2015-07-28 05:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting Manuscript, but table is missing in the pdf. Final Evaluation is n?tig possible

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 20933

Title: Poor CD4 count is a predictor of untreated depression in human immunodeficiency virus-positive African-Americans

Reviewer's code: 00547906

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-09 09:52

Date reviewed: 2015-09-11 04:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript explores interesting relationship between CD4 count and depression. It found that there is association between poor CD4 count and untreated depression. But this relationship could be reflecting the relationship between poor CD4 count and low general compliance which is associated with poor compliance with ART treatment. This seemed to be verified to be the 50% concordance between depression treatment compliance and ART compliance reported by authors. Further, The difference in CD4 count between untreated and no-depression controls may be more relevant to support the relationship between poor CD4 count and existence of depression. It is not clear what the authors meant by independent association between depression and poor CD4 count. It may be beneficial to clarify it is the association between depression and CD4 count, independent of adherence?