



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 27893

Title: Voxel-based magnetic resonance imaging investigation of poor and preserved clinical insight in people with schizophrenia

Reviewer’s code: 00722465

Reviewer’s country: Turkey

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-03-02 16:59

Date reviewed: 2016-03-12 20:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The purpose of this study, using a categorical approach, maintained clinical insight as well as those with healthy participants was relatively poor clinical view clearly in stable patients with schizophrenia in terms of regional gray matter to detect abnormalities. Forty stable schizophrenia outpatients (20 with preserved and 20 with poor insight) and 20 healthy participants were included to study. the Birchwood Insight Scale (BIS; self-report measure) was used for insight. Authors found that the lower fronto-temporal, parahippocampal, occipital and cerebellar grey matter volumes in patients with poor insight, compared with preserved insight patients and healthy participants. Preserved insight patients did not differ significantly from healthy participants. When scanned previously literature, Magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) studies revealed fronto-temporal cortical gray matter volume reductions in schizophrenia. However, it can be determined that there is not much literature. The authors have made comparisons through the concept of insight Therefore study is valuable. I think the study will provide an important contribution to the literature. The number of patients and control subjects included in the study is enough. Introduction and discussion



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

section are sufficient. Adequate and appropriate literatures were used in the study. However, The weakest point of the work for me; " Healthy participants had more years in education than poor insight patients [t(38)=2.11, P=0.04] but differed only at a trend level when compared with preserved insight patients [t(38)=1.77, P=0.08]. Healthy participants also had higher NART IQ than poor insight patients [t(38)=2.47, P=0.02] but did not differ from preserved insight patients". Which is part of the results. I think that the results of these parameters that affects clinical important. Nevertheless, I suggest accept this manuscript.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry
ESPS manuscript NO: 27893
Title: Voxel-based magnetic resonance imaging investigation of poor and preserved clinical insight in people with schizophrenia
Reviewer's code: 02446677
Reviewer's country: Spain
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2016-03-02 16:59
Date reviewed: 2016-03-13 08:04

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT, CONCLUSION. It contains checkboxes for various evaluation criteria like 'Grade A: Excellent', 'Duplicate publication', and 'Plagiarism'.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript presents data on a structural MRI study using voxel-based morphometry in a sample of 20 patients with schizophrenia and preserved insight, 20 clinically and demographically-matched patients except for poor insight and 20 healthy participants. The authors found lower grey matter volumes in a lot of brain areas in patients with poor insight. From these findings, they suggest that clinical insight is dependent on complex neurocognitive interplay with contributions from multiple neural networks. The study is well designed and the manuscript is clearly written and easy to read all throughout. My main concerns are a) the lack of originality which may decrease its interest for potential readers, and b) the potential effect of confounding factors. Although the authors have done an effort for controlling several clinical factors, some others such as medication effects could still be playing a role. Stable medication and chlorpromazine equivalents may not be enough to control for such effects and authors should clarify whether there were differences in the type of antipsychotic medication between both groups. Second-generation antipsychotics are associated with larger grey matter volumes than first-generation ones. Differences



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

among the presence and quantity of particular compounds belonging to these two families could influence their results.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 27893

Title: Voxel-based magnetic resonance imaging investigation of poor and preserved clinical insight in people with schizophrenia

Reviewer's code: 02445374

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-03-02 16:59

Date reviewed: 2016-03-20 17:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent paper. Well written with important findings.