



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 55835

Title: Liver transplantation and aging - is there a limit?

Reviewer's code: 03727761

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Postdoctoral Fellow

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Croatia

Manuscript submission date: 2020-04-04

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-09 03:36

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-09 03:46

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this is an interesting study topic, actually, the age of recipient is increasing followed with medical development. several things needs to be pointed out 1. study on elder donor should be reviewed, 2. change on trend of treatment (surgical? medical? drug?) on elder patients.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 55835

Title: Liver transplantation and aging - is there a limit?

Reviewer's code: 03011144

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BM BCh, DNB

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: Croatia

Manuscript submission date: 2020-04-04

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang (Quit in 2020)

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-04-13 06:48

Reviewer performed review: 2020-04-18 06:31

Review time: 4 Days and 23 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Title & manuscript are not coherent, as manuscript summarizes the recent developments rather than safety / morbidity of transplant in elderly 2. Its not clear whether the authors are trying to address the age limitations or disease limitations of liver transplant 3. Introduction ends with a bias, "With the scarcity of organs for transplantation in mind, transplant procedures in elderly population need to be carefully weighed up against possible alternative treatments." 4. Discussion on the individual condition does not focus on the actual survival / risk benefit of liver transplant in elderly 5. Conclusion does not point out the age limit of liver transplant, which the title implies 6. Conclusion is more elaborate rather than pointing out the take home message crisply 7. Table is a repeat summary of the discussion, without data of the patients (age, morbidity, outcome, etc).

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 55835

Title: Liver transplantation and aging - is there a limit?

Reviewer's code: 03011144

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BM BCh, DNB

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: Croatia

Manuscript submission date: 2020-04-04

Reviewer chosen by: Ya-Juan Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-30 08:30

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-30 09:18

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The relevant issues raised were addressed satisfactorily in the revised manuscript by the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

authors.