



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 75011

**Title:** Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05378296

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Romania

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-01-29

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-01-29 16:34

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-02-02 14:47

**Review time:** 3 Days and 22 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The manuscript entitled "Kidney Disease in Non-Renal Solid Organ Transplantation Population: A Review" prepared by K.J. Swanson provides data regarding the current literature about kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation. The manuscript is organised into several sections in which the author point out the most relevant data regarding kidney diseases after pancreas, lung, liver, heart and intestinal transplantation. To improve the manuscript, we recommend: Major points: 1. In the materials and methods section, an expansion of the data presented or a figure related to the research process conducted in the different databases could be a good factor to highlight the information presented. 2. The tables should be associated with legends. Minor point: 1. In the sentence "While quantifying the prevalence of CKD in any population is a daunting task, several studies have noted an incidence of CKD in non-kidney solid organ transplant ranging between 6-21%" the author should add a reference related to the data presented.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 75011

**Title:** Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05384570

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Malaysia

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-01-29

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-01-29 05:10

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-02-07 14:55

**Review time:** 9 Days and 9 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Interesting article on kidney disease in patients with nonrenal transplantation with comprehensive overview. Great work!



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 75011

**Title:** Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05022758

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Poland

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-01-29

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-01-30 15:38

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-02-09 14:12

**Review time:** 9 Days and 22 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Undoubtedly, chronic kidney disease is an extremely important clinical issue in organ transplant patients. The author undertook the difficult task of reviewing the literature, for which he should be congratulated. However, several important shortcomings should be mentioned. Author doesn't provide accurate numbers when quoting other authors - i.e. "non-CNI related causes of kidney disease have been implicated at rates between 27-40% in solid organ transplant recipients who have undergone kidney biopsies". Such numbers don't appear in the original article. The author also doesn't mention the fact that CNI related causes of nephrotoxicity in the same work accounted for 46-60% of cases and constituted the largest group of reported histologic lesions. Organ specific paragraphs constitute of chaotic presentation of random manuscripts providing a compilation of abstracts with no clear clinical application in mind. Despite a vast amount of available data on CNI minimalization strategies, the author does not provide a reliable and clinically useful review. Moreover the suggestion that the use of belatacept is a safe immunosuppressive strategy in liver transplant patients is at most controversial. A single quoted manuscript by LaMattina constituted of a small group of patients which were subsequently converted to CNI. Most of betalcept studies in liver transplantation show higher incidence of rejections rates, death and PTLD (particulary in EBV "- patients). With the available data the use of belatacept cannot be recommended in liver transplant recipients. Additional studies with sufficient power are needed to determine efficacy of belatacept in the liver transplant population. While I appreciate the considerable amount of work that went into preparing the manuscript, it is extremely difficult for me to recommend this review as clinically valuable.



## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Transplantation*

**Manuscript NO:** 75011

**Title:** Kidney disease in non-kidney solid organ transplantation

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05022758

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Poland

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-01-29

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jing-Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-04-22 07:04

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-04-22 07:09

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Thank you for the revision. The overall quality of the manuscript has increased.