

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4089

Title: Exercise After Heart Transplantation - An Overview

Reviewer code: 00504406

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-14 15:48

Date reviewed: 2013-06-17 02:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] Existed	[] Major revision
		[] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent review regarding the topic of exercise after heart transplantation. The authors are addressing all the past and current issues and provide detailed data about the type and the strengths of exercise in this frail population. Minor comments The first abbreviation for CAV should be put on page 15 instead of page 16.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4089

Title: Exercise After Heart Transplantation - An Overview

Reviewer code: 00504341

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-14 15:48

Date reviewed: 2013-06-19 00:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this overview: Exercise After Heart Transplantation, Nytr?en K et al. analysed the value of exercise after heart transplantation Homecoming to practical daily life with worthy quality of life is nowadays the desired result after cardiac transplantation. To achieve this outcome, aggressive exercise rehabilitation has been considered as a useful resource in latest years. In a previous recent publication, Nytr?en et al hypothesised that high-intensity interval training is a useful form of exercise in heart transplants recipients. The authors showed that a long-term -program is an applicable, effective and safe way to improve VO (2 peak), muscular exercise capacity and general health in heart transplant recipients. This exhaustive and well-made overview, that we are currently analyzing, certainly gives the reader complete information about this topic currently of practical value in long term recovery of cardiac transplantation. The information showed a comprehensive view of the matter, detailed in a way easy to follow and understand, accompanied by a useful complementary graphical information. I consider important the conclusion of the authors when they stated: The time seems to be right for rethinking the use of exercise among heart transplant recipient and offer an "up to date" physical training principle to a group of patients who not yet has been offered, or accepted to, this kind of exercise (High-intensity interval training). PS: Please control bibliographic mention 35 on page 7

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4089

Title: Exercise After Heart Transplantation - An Overview

Reviewer code: 00227648

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-14 15:48

Date reviewed: 2013-06-20 01:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] Existed	[] Major revision
		[] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is a comprehensive evaluation of the literature on exercise physiology after heart transplnatation in adults. General comments: Did the etiology of end stage heart failure matter? One would imaging that individuals with OHT for myocarditis do better than those with long-standing failure and perhaps prior operations and pulmonary vascular changes. Any information on that? The authors spend quite some time discussing their own work. Perhaps this would be a place where the paper could be tightened. In it is present form it seems a little bit unfocused. Specific comments: Page 4, second paragraph, second sentence - would revise for better readability. Page

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4089

Title: Exercise After Heart Transplantation - An Overview

Reviewer code: 00054253

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-14 15:48

Date reviewed: 2013-06-20 03:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments to Author/Editor This is good review particularly as the authors discuss exercise in relation to complications of heart transplantation and quality of life. The English is generally good, but there are one or two points where some clarification is needed. The authors include far too many abbreviations, which makes it tedious for the reader. The number of abbreviations should be cut by at least 50%. One abbreviation mentioned in the text (CRP) is not described in the text or the abbreviation list, and should be (Page 18). Introduction- The authors should refer to healthy individuals rather than normal individuals The authors should define what they mean by chronotropic incompetence, as this may not be clear to every reader Page 5, middle paragraph, ".... Mechanisms behind, if they...." Page 6, first line of first full paragraph - "There is much evidence...." Page 6, second line, second paragraph, "....Belief today is that, because...." Page 7, it is not clear what is meant by ".... There through decades have been uncertainty...." Page 8, last full paragraph- it would be helpful if the authors included the number of participants in this trial. Page 9, line 4 "Our results are...." Page 15- effect on complications- The authors conclude on page 16 that the effect of exercise on CAV has not been reported. Therefore, the preceding section could be reduced in length. Page 18, middle paragraph first line "shown" Page 19, second full paragraph, last line- it is not clear what is meant by ".... Has been offered, or accepted to,"

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4089

Title: Exercise After Heart Transplantation - An Overview

Reviewer code: 00504335

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-14 15:48

Date reviewed: 2013-06-24 15:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is well written, no special comments.