Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation
ESPS Manuscript NO: 3797
Title: The role of IL-10 in the progression of kidney disease
Reviewer code: 00504373
Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling
Date sent for review: 2013-05-24 14:59
Date reviewed: 2013-05-29 17:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Summary:

The authors Sinuani and colleagues present a monograph on the nature of the immunomodulatory cytokine IL-10, and its role in normal and diseased kidney. The authors provide a good overview of the current status of the IL-10 research.

The structure is clear, language is precise and to the point. All in all, a good read on an important molecule in this area of academic, clinical and pharmacological research.

As the authors will see, the major comments below would not even be major comments in other submissions, but would rather fall under minor comments.

Major comments:

Page 4, line 20. “about 1600 genes and down-regulation of about 1300 genes [24].” The number of overexpressed and underexpressed does not mean much without contextualization with other studies and providing more information. The number of differentially expressed genes is

dependent on the experimental setup, number of samples, precision of measurements, dosing of agents, etc. Hence I would refrain from providing numbers here. The authors could mention pathways which were dysregulated in the Jung-study.

Page 5, line 2-3. The first sentence of this paragraph should go towards the end the entire chapter. The next sentence is a much better introduction to this section. Please remove:" The diverse activities of IL-10 make it an important therapeutic target in of renal diseases."

Page 6, line 22 and Page 7, line 6 – 31. Could these parts be joined, as they both discuss the role of TGFbeta? The part on page 6 almost appears like the introduction to what comes on page 7. These two parts are separated by a section on cystatin C which is then again being picked up after the second TGFbeta part on page 7.

Page 8, line 23-25. It is unclear from the sentence alone whether higher or lower than normal levels of IL-10 (in the graft!?) are a marker of chronic lesions. Experts in the field will know, but the sentence needs clarification for other interested readers.

Page 9, line 3-9. This seems like a stand-alone paragraph, particularly the Cyst-C part in the beginning. There is no connection to the big section before, and no obvious connection with the part following, which talks about the TGFbeta-IL-10 axis. Please reorganize, bring in IL-10 again with Cyst-C to remind the reader, without being over-redundant with previous sections.

Page 9, 26-27. Were the increased amounts of cytokines, including IL-10, due to the increased number of mesangial cells, their activation or both? Please clarify, if the data allow.

Minor comments:

Page 4, line 6. "…activation members…" Please insert "of".

Page 4, line 8-9. As has been done at other places in the manuscript, it is good practice to first spell out the term and then provide the abbreviation. In this case, I propose to write: "…bind to the STAT-binding elements (SBE) in the promoters. …"

Page 4, line 14. "…IL-10 [21, 22[." Please invert bracket at the end.

Page 4, line 15-17. This sentence does not flow. How about: For example, IL-10 modulates translation of TNF-α mRNA via activation of p38MAPK, thereby increasing TNF-α production by mononuclear cells [23].

Page 5, line 5-6. The "is from" construction needs to be changed. How about "Mesangial cells are the major local source of IL-10 in normal adult kidney."

Page 5, line11-13. This sentence is awkward. Please restructure.

Page 10, line 1. "tubular cells to themselves". I suggest: " …it induces the tubular cells to undergo hypertrophy themselves,…."

Page 5, line 21-25. Again, this sentence does not read well. Suggestion: "Several studies have demonstrated an association *of the up-regulation of IL-10 and* the pathophysiology of various kidney diseases, all of which are related to mesangial cell proliferation, such as mesangioproliferative glomerulonephritis, IgA nephropathy, and the acute phase of microscopic polyangiitis [37-39]

Page 5, line 26. "MC" This abbreviation has not been mentioned yet. Please define at an earlier place if you really want to use this. It never appears in the following anymore.

Page 67, line 32. Suggestion: Not only does IL-10 act on …., it has also been shown…