

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10290

Title: Influence of Maintenance Steroid on the Outcomes in First-Time Deceased Donor Kidney Transplant Recipients: Analysis by Induction Type

Reviewer code: 00504341

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-03-25 22:34

Date reviewed: 2014-03-26 17:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study Sureshkumar K Kalathil, analyze the impact of steroid maintenance on the outcomes in kidney transplant recipients, in this review the author analyzes the problem stratified by induction agent received. Using OPTN / UNOS database a significant number of patients (37.217) are included. As a main conclusion, the study showed an association between increased overall graft failure as well as patient death risks and steroid addition to a CNI/MMF maintenance regimen in patients undergoing a first deceased donor kidney transplantation following induction with R-ATG. The issue is certainly of current interest and yet not clearly defined, taken account various current studies, some of them mentioned by the authors. Overall, the manuscript clearly describes the current situation about this problem representing therefore a subject of interest to the reader.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10290

Title: Influence of Maintenance Steroid on the Outcomes in First-Time Deceased Donor Kidney Transplant Recipients: Analysis by Induction Type

Reviewer code: 00503284

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-03-25 22:34

Date reviewed: 2014-04-08 01:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a retrospective analysis on >37000 KT patients. Authors associated worse overall graft and patient outcome - but not death-censored graft outcome - with triple therapy including steroids, after r-ATG. It drives us to the conclusion that more patients died with functioning grafts under steroids. However, patients under steroids were more often diabetic, African-American, under dialysis, with high dialysis vintage, with higher PRA, and received more frequently grafts from donors with CVA... The causative role of steroids, per se, cannot be assumed (the authors also agree with this; there was verified only an association between the 2 facts. Two main possibilities were pointed out as contributors to increased death with functioning graft: was the adverse CV profile, under steroids, the reason for the worse outcome? Or, was the "enhanced" immunosuppression power (with steroids) the reason? We know that from that triple therapy, there are drugs with more immunosuppressive power... Of note, the low rate of malignancies, even they have had r-ATG, known as increasing the risk of malignancy.