

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 21132

Title: Preservation solutions used during abdominal transplantation: Current status and outcomes

Reviewer's code: 02098940

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-02 18:07

Date reviewed: 2015-07-10 21:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript gives review about the current knowledge concerning the preservation solutions used during abdominal transplantation. The authors should describe the methodology used for the search of papers reported in this review. Other recent published papers should be reported: for example 1) Oltean M1, Churchill TA. Organ-specific solutions and strategies for the intestinal preservation. Int Rev Immunol. 2014 May-Jun;33(3):234-44. doi: 10.3109/08830185.2013.853764. Epub 2013 Dec 12; 2) Parsons RF1, Guarrera JV. Preservation solutions for static cold storage of abdominal allografts: which is best? Curr Opin Organ Transplant. 2014 Apr;19(2):100-7. doi: 10.1097/MOT.0000000000000063. The preservation solutions reported are used for cold storage preservation and not for machine perfusion preservation: it should be declared in the first part of this review. The attempt to use a single solution for multiple organ procurement and preservation should be reported (i. e.: Karam et al 2005, doi:10.1111/j.1432-2277.2005.00083.x). Minor: Page 9, line 16: gluthaione

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 21132

Title: Preservation solutions used during abdominal transplantation: Current status and outcomes

Reviewer's code: 00005216

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-02 18:07

Date reviewed: 2015-07-10 22:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Latchana et al thoroughly review the literature on use of preservation solutions in abdominal organ transplantation. There have been no major advances on this topic in the last few years (accordingly, no reference in the review dates beyond 2012): however, the paper is balanced, well organized and enjoyable.