

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 20920

Title: Perioperative effects of high doses of intraoperative thymoglobulin induction in liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 02462024

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-06-28 10:11

Date reviewed: 2015-08-07 23:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for an interesting and useful study It is not clear to me whether the patients were consented and how they were randomised (if indeed they had been randomised.) Some areas of language need tidying up as some sentences are not easy to follow.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 20920

Title: Perioperative effects of high doses of intraoperative thymoglobulin induction in liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03015790

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-06-28 10:11

Date reviewed: 2015-08-03 00:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments -

- Overall, it's a well performed and thought out study with many relevant findings.
- However, the extremely small sample size makes it difficult to draw any strong conclusions
- Power calculations were not performed making it hard to define primary and secondary endpoints. Please provide a sample size calculation to improve validity of the results.
- It's unclear why some patients received Everolimus in one group and others did not.

Minor revisions -

Title Page -

Author contributions - Instead of "conceived, designed and performed the paper", change it to "Conceived and designed the research study; wrote and revised the manuscript".

Conflict of interest statement has a "12" which may not belong there.

Abstract - TEG has not been defined yet in the abstract.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Introduction - "The potential for adverse events after ATG administration has been evaluated so far mainly in the long period" needs to be rephrased.

Methods - Please provide a sample size calculation to improve the validity of results.

Results - Need major language polishing and simplification to make it easily understandable.

Conclusion - Given the small sample size and lack of power calculation, it's hard to generalize the findings and conclude that thymoglobulin should not be used as an induction agent. The conclusion should report the study's major limitations.