

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 20995

Title: Living donor liver transplantation with abdominal wall reconstruction for hepatocellular carcinoma with needle track seeding

Reviewer's code: 02861055

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-12 17:09

Date reviewed: 2015-07-31 18:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted manuscript by Yang et al. reports the case of a living donor liver transplantation associated with abdominal wall reconstruction in a single stage surgery to treat hepatocellular carcinoma with malignant cell seeding of a percutaneous biliary drainage. Despite the patient died after 22 months for HCC recurrence in the lungs, no signs of abdominal wall recurrence were observed by the Authors. Despite the rarity of the malignant cell seeding given the accuracy of radiologic diagnosis of HCC, the paper is of interest. A number of issues are listed below. - The Authors should clarify if a consent was obtained from the patient. - The Authors should clarify if, apart from the malignant cell seeding, the dimensions of the HCC nodule(s) fulfilled the Milano criteria for liver transplantation. Therefore they should add to the paper the number and dimensions of the HCC nodule(s) and specify the imagining used for staging. - The Authors should provide data about the histological tumor assessment after liver transplantation, since this information defines the risk of tumor recurrence. In particular, the Authors should add: pathological tumor stage, vascular invasion, and histological differentiation. - Please clarify if the PTBD was still in place at the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

moment of fistula formation. - Please open all abbreviations at their first use in the manuscript. - Figure 2 is not clear. The text is too small to be red. The Authors should add text information in the legend and refer to the image with symbols. - The paper should be revised by an English native speaker.