

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 22007

Title: Overview of extended release tacrolimus in solid organ transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00504150

Reviewer's country: Canada

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-08-07 15:20

Date reviewed: 2015-08-29 05:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting mini-review on a topic increasingly popular and clinically relevant in solid organ transplantation. The review is, in general, well written, although there are some stylistic issues which should be addressed. Pending issues are adequately underlined as well as the challenges to be faced for clinical translation of current knowledge in the field. Main questions related to the topic are well addressed in a concise manner, probably too concise. For example, p values for comparison data in each cited study are not necessary. There are several minor points that the authors should elaborate. 1/ The first sentence in the Introduction section, starting with "Tacrolimus is an ... in combination with ..." is too definitive. There are many ways for combination therapies in kidney transplant recipients depending on transplant programs. Induction therapy can be thymoglobulin or alemtuzumab or others. Please re-write the first sentence. 2/ In Abstract, there is no need for abbreviation MMF as MMF is only used once in the abstract. CF should be spelled out (cystic fibrosis) in the abstract. 3/ The authors used so many unnecessary abbreviations in the main text. Those should be simply spelled out without abbreviation when used only once. Examples include but not limited to: IL-2 in page 3, CYP3A in page 3, PRA in page 8, CIT



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

in page 8, DGF in page 8, CrCl in page 8, FSGS in page 9, MDRD4 in page 12, ELTR in page 12, MPR in page 20, BNF in page 20, and NHS in page 20. 4/ Miss spelling in the title. "Transplantation" should be "transplantation".

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 22007

Title: Overview of extended release tacrolimus in solid organ transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00503228

Reviewer's country: Iraq

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-08-07 15:20

Date reviewed: 2015-08-29 13:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I think it is better to make a systematic review instead of a mini review on this important topic, and meta-analysis if applicable. Moreover, the study has not been prepared well. For example in the first sentence of the abstract, while you were talking about what tacrolimus is, you've brought manufacturer's data which doesn't make any sense. Some English revision seem also needed (e.g. "It is not recommended in the use of liver transplant patient's due to the increased risk of mortality in female recipients.")

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 22007

Title: Overview of extended release tacrolimus in solid organ transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00070310

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-08-07 15:20

Date reviewed: 2015-09-09 17:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reviews extended release tacrolimus in solid organ transplantation. It is well written, and acceptable for World Journal of transplantation except one. Please mention the role of extended release tacrolimus in other solid organ transplantation (pancreas, small intestine, multiple organ transplantation)