

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 23280

**Title:** The immunosuppressive potency of mTOR inhibitors in solid-organ transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 00503191

**Reviewer's country:** Germany

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-11-06 11:42

**Date reviewed:** 2015-11-12 01:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, thank you for submitting your Review. The baseline data of immunosuppression are very superficial and although the figures provide some clearance the studies you mention do not provide a very accurate Image of the current Status. A meta Analysis of the use of immunosuppression has already been made and you could improve your manuscript by providing some statistical data.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 23280

**Title:** The immunosuppressive potency of mTOR inhibitors in solid-organ transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 00504828

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-11-06 11:42

**Date reviewed:** 2015-11-14 08:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This short review manuscript summarizes immune suppressive effect of mTOR inhibitors in regard to transplantation. The review particularly focuses on inhibition of T/B-cell proliferation and immunoprotection. Useful illustrations and tables are provided to help understand the topic. Major comment 1. none. Minor comments 1. Figure 1. I think it is visually better to use different sign for inhibitors and activators/stimulators. In this figure, zigzag arrows are used for stimulus (OKT3) and inhibitors. It may be confusing for readers. I would use zigzag arrows for stimulators and dead-end arrows 2. Very minor formatting issue: There is no space after periods in many sentences.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 23280

**Title:** The immunosuppressive potency of mTOR inhibitors in solid-organ transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 00503243

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-11-06 11:42

**Date reviewed:** 2015-11-14 22:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good review concerning the main ways of studying the immunopotency evaluation of mTORi. I have several concerns principally on the introduction section: a) Bottom page 5. The limitation of long term survival is also due to disease recurrence and to death with functioning graft: this must be added; b) page 6 line 4: nothing is said about the mTORi side effects; please add and comment c) page 6 line 11 : minimizing, eliminating avoiding. Many trials failed because of the high incidence of ABMR (Salvadori et al World Journal of Transplantation). This point must be treated and commented by the authors. d) The explanation of the mTORi is not clear and the figures are not enough explained in the text. mTORC2 is mentioned without explaining the molecule and its role. Additionally, English wording should be improved by an English language born colleague.