

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 21396

Title: Hematopoietic stem cell transplantation for auto immune rheumatic diseases

Reviewer's code: 02928802

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-14 10:58

Date reviewed: 2015-08-13 13:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Jain S and Ravindran V reviewed hematopoietic stem cell transplantation for auto immune rheumatic diseases. The manuscript is well designed. There are some concerns. General comments 1. The author reviewed the hematopoietic stem cell transplantation for auto immune rheumatic diseases. It is better to summarized the advantages and the disadvantages of HSCT in the manuscript. Besides, it is better to add a picture of HSCT treatment procedure for better understanding. 2. Page 6, "most of the data available for HSCT in SSc has shown a significant improvement in skin scores in patients and moderate improvement in FVC and DLCO." "Survival data from ASTIS trial, however, show while HSCT was associated with increased treatment-related mortality in the first year after treatment, HSCT conferred a significant long-term event-free survival benefit". It is better if the author could provide these data in detail. 3. On page 4, paragraph 2, the author mentioned "In the beginning the use of HSCT had been limited to refractory diseases due to Later it became clear that transplant related mortality and morbidity is a function of the disease state and conditioning regimen". This paragraph should be provided more references.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 21396

Title: Hematopoietic stem cell transplantation for auto immune rheumatic diseases

Reviewer's code: 02446280

Reviewer's country: Russia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-14 10:58

Date reviewed: 2015-08-13 15:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Review is good written and points to the main criteria of the multifactorial diseases treatment- careful patient selection. It is especially important for the diseases with unknown molecular mechanisms. The paper could be recommended for publication however with some minor modifications. In the introductory section Authors refers only to 2 types of stem cells however, recently a Nobel awarded third type of stem cells has emerged- induced or reprogrammed stem cells. Authors also stated that "Currently there are no approved clinical uses of embryonic stem cells". However at least 5 FDA approved clinical trials of phase 1-2 are under way now and results are very encouraging. I think that after these corrections manuscript could be recommended for publication.