

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 22841

Title: Role of cytomegalovirus on the maturation and function of monocyte derived dendritic cells of liver transplant patients.

Reviewer's code: 00504591

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-31 14:13

Date reviewed: 2015-11-11 11:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled, "Role of cytomegalovirus on the maturation and function of monocyte derived dendritic cells of liver transplant patients", by Shariat et al., demonstrated the functional defects of dendritic cells in CMV reactivated liver transplant recipients when compared to those without CMV reactivation or healthy norms demonstrating the differences in cytokine concentrations and expressions. I have some comments. Comments 1. What did author mean by reactivation? Please clarify the pretransplant sero-status of CMV of the recipients. 2. Please clarify the results of pp65 antigenemia. 3. Author should demonstrate the acute cellular rejection of the cohort, since they assumed that he functional defects of dendritic cells in CMV reactivated liver transplant recipients may lead to rejection. 4. Results section is very difficult to follow. Please shorten the descriptions, and make it comprehensive.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 22841

Title: Role of cytomegalovirus on the maturation and function of monocyte derived dendritic cells of liver transplant patients.

Reviewer's code: 00504119

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-31 14:13

Date reviewed: 2015-11-11 20:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

the article about : Role of cytomegalovirus on the maturation and function of monocyte derived dendritic cells of liver transplant patients ihas good information but need clarify the definon of reactivation, data about antigenemia and clarify acute rejection incidence between the different sample studied

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 22841

Title: Role of cytomegalovirus on the maturation and function of monocyte derived dendritic cells of liver transplant patients.

Reviewer's code: 00036905

Reviewer's country: The Netherlands

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-31 14:13

Date reviewed: 2015-11-11 20:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Two small groups of patients and controls but important results, which may lead to further investigations.