

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 30496

Title: Influence of tacrolimus metabolism rate on renal function after solid organ transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00503339

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-07 17:46

Date reviewed: 2016-10-07 20:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Worried Transplant Teams concerned with how to optimize and preserve the action of Tacrolimus in Kidney and Liver Transplant recipients will find current concerns and possible solutions well stated. But, when they return to their Operating Rooms the next morning, they have not been armed with a proven empiric regimen that is likely to preserve Tacrolimus effectiveness without generating new possible problems. Your suggestion that larger Clinical Trials of Drug combination A versus B would prove helpful does not answer the question of how to manage the patient about to be transplanted immediately. One way of resolving the lack of a proven effective means of optimal Tacrolimus management might be to include a brief "Work Protocol" as a component of your Manuscript to assist Transplant Teams in determining just how they might wish to participate in generating an answer to the overriding question of "How might the best strategy for Tacrolimus usage be determined?". Recognizing that the "Approach to Tacrolimus Usage" must be empirically clarified, the most helpful communication might be a concise statement of how this question can be answered is the shortest time.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 30496

Title: Influence of tacrolimus metabolism rate on renal function after solid organ transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00503176

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-07 17:46

Date reviewed: 2016-10-07 22:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written and useful review on the topic. I have no comments - the manuscript is ready for publication.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 30496

Title: Influence of tacrolimus metabolism rate on renal function after solid organ transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00503286

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-07 17:46

Date reviewed: 2016-10-10 14:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper should be published, after minor correction with the editor.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

ESPS manuscript NO: 30496

Title: Influence of tacrolimus metabolism rate on renal function after solid organ transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00504828

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-10-07 17:46

Date reviewed: 2016-10-29 07:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review manuscript seeks clinically useful parameters to personalize the best daily dose of one of the clinically used calcineurin inhibitors, tacrolimus (TAC), during organ transplantation. The core of the manuscript includes a line of research by the author's group and credible. The introduction clearly state the current challenge of using TAC as an immunosuppressant in organ transplantation - very narrow therapeutic window makes physicians very difficult to determine the best daily dose of TAC. The topic is absolutely well aligned to the aim and scope of the journal and I have no doubt that the topic is important in this area. Major comment 1. Page 7, from line 26~. CYP3A5*1-expressors are characterized as fast TAC metabolizers meaning that TAC will be quickly metabolized, correct? In the following sentence "...TAC metabolism is only present in CYP3A5*3/*3 patients while the decline is absent in CYP3A5*1 allele carriers.". I am confused here. If "decline=rapid TAC metabolism", then the description in this paragraph sounds controversial. It may require clearer re-writing. Minor comments 1. Pages 4~5 "In pancreas, heart, lung, or combined organ transplantation,...Notably, none of these CNI-free...immunosuppressive efficacy



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

that equals those of CNIs". I think literature(s) may need to be cited. Please confirm. 2. Page 6, line 9. "...leads to an immediate increase in GFR". I guess GFR appears first time here in the text. Maybe better to spell out abbreviations in their first appearance (Sorry if I missed in previous page(s)). Also, mTOR is shown as mTor in many cases. I think TOR should be all capital letters. Just a little thing but better to correct.