

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 37027

Title: Elderly donor graft for liver transplantation: Never too late

Reviewer's code: 02099384

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-11-05

Date reviewed: 2017-11-06

Review time: 1 Day

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Chela et al reviewed the outcome of the use of elderly donor graft in liver transplantation. I have some comments. 1. (Introduction) Is the definition of elderly aged>60 years? If yes, what is the background of cutting off line at 60 year of age? 2. (Impact of age on the liver) The authors described that the hepatic mass and blood flow decreased by age. To what degree? 3. (Functional change) The authors described that the rate of regeneration decreased by aging. To what degree? 4. (Outcome of using elderly grafts) Other reports than ref 11 should be included.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 37027

Title: Elderly donor graft for liver transplantation: Never too late

Reviewer's code: 00503243

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-11-05

Date reviewed: 2017-11-09

Review time: 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review facing the well known problem of transplanting liver from old donors. The authors treat extensively the changes of old livers and their evaluation. I have some concerns from the practical point of view. One relevant problem is the one of transmitting malignancies. I do not think that ultrasound examination is enough to avoid the risk. In our experience many times we found at autopsy small cancers in the liver, lung or prostate. This point should be treated more extensively to give useful informations. Additionally the references are poor and they should be enriched as the practice of transplanting liver also from very old people is performed currently by many centers