

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Virology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14870

Title: CD4 cutoff point for initiation of anti retroviral therapy: Strategies and challenges

Reviewer's code: 00504096

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-30 08:48

Date reviewed: 2014-11-21 02:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present review article tries to investigate the feasibility of WHO guidelines on earlier initiation of antiretroviral treatment in resource-limited countries specially in the MENA region while considering the lack of enough epidemiological data and diagnostic tools in these regions. Comments: The manuscript is informative and relatively well-written. However some comments are strongly suggested to improve the scientific writing style of the manuscript as a review article which are summarized in the following: - As a review manuscript, the article may require "summarizing of the information in self-designed Tables, charts and figures". Authors are strongly encouraged to consider several summarizing tools for the provided information in a number of tables and charts. - Please provide a net final conclusion at the end of each section based on the provided data and the opinion of authors. Accordingly, please provide a net conclusion at the END of conclusion section to indicate the opinion of the author for this new WHO guideline for early initiation of the therapy based on the discussed articles. - Please discuss the available Data of MENA region with that of other similar regions for the early initiation of the therapy by including their studies. For example please include the data of a recent study in sub-Saharan African HIV-infected adults for early



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

antiretroviral therapy and compare with that of MENA region (Anglaret X et al, Could early antiretroviral therapy entail more risks than benefits in sub-Saharan African HIV-infected adults? A model-based analysis, Antivir Ther. 2013;18(1):45-55.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Virology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14870

Title: CD4 cutoff point for initiation of anti retroviral therapy: Strategies and challenges

Reviewer's code: 00484099

Reviewer's country: Chile

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-30 08:48

Date reviewed: 2014-11-18 03:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review raised awareness about the poor epidemiological data and other issues, such as poor diagnostic that delay people that, are infected with HIV, to start antiretroviral therapy on Middle East -North African region. Is well and clearly written, except one paragraph that call my attention: "Apparently, available antiretroviral drugs are prescribed to delay immunologic failure and control HIV related diseases rather than definitive eradication of the virus [18]".The word apparently is not appropriate since that is the goal of the currently available ART. Other than that I am ok with this manuscript to be published

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Virology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14870

Title: CD4 cutoff point for initiation of anti retroviral therapy: Strategies and challenges

Reviewer's code: 00504045

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-30 08:48

Date reviewed: 2014-11-18 14:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present review discussed some issues, focusing on the feasibility of new WHO guidelines, on the early initiation of antiretroviral treatment (ART) among HIV-infected patients based on CD4+ T-cell counts in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region. The manuscript is informative and worthy of publication. Specific aspects: 1. Line numbers should be set on all pages for review. 2. The manuscript requires a minor language editing. 3. The title of the manuscript needs to be improved. 4. Abstract: MENA Region=the MENA region; patients' CD4 counts=patients' CD4+ T-cell counts. 5. The authors are suggested to include some tables and figures to intuitively present some investigation data. 6. The Conclusion section should include authors' opinions and prospects on the topics. 7. The journal names of the references should be formatted in a consistent and professional style. Some references should be checked, e.g. Ref. 41.