

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Virology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 26928

**Title:** Spread of human immunodeficiency virus 1 among MSM is emerging as a genuine social concern and affecting the general populace - case reports from Eastern India

**Reviewer's code:** 00506495

**Reviewer's country:** Israel

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-05-03 10:52

**Date reviewed:** 2016-05-03 21:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript deals with an important subject – HIV transmission between men having sex with men (MSM). In India MSM is illegal and there is a very significant negative stigma associated with MSM. Early treatment of HIV-1 infected patients is important and is well accepted, not only for the benefit of the patients but also to reduce the risk of HIV transmission. Thus, in this respect the article does not add much. However, in view of the social issues discussed in the manuscript, and the fact that MSM in India may spread the virus also to women (to “hide” that they are homosexuals), without disclosing that they are HIV carriers, I feel it is important to present this study especially for India and other countries where homosexuality is badly perceived. I have made recommendations in the attached revised manuscript, mainly text, which can be viewed by using the Review “track changes” mode in Word. I suggest presenting the blood profiles of both patients in a Table and to add the CD4, CD8 and viremia after treatment too.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Virology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 26928

**Title:** Spread of human immunodeficiency virus 1 among MSM is emerging as a genuine social concern and affecting the general populace - case reports from Eastern India

**Reviewer's code:** 00504040

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-05-03 10:52

**Date reviewed:** 2016-05-05 22:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reported two cases infected HIV-1 from MSM in eastern India, rendering an understanding of the difficulties and health risks faced by the MSM population, and providing a complete evidence for the medical practitioners in dealing and treating with AIDS patients. This manuscript is suitable for publication in this journal, but it should be given a major revision due to the unreadable English language, in which, a lot of wrong and nonstandard rhetoric and grammar are used. Strongly suggest to be revised under helps by native English speakers.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Virology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 26928

**Title:** Spread of human immunodeficiency virus 1 among MSM is emerging as a genuine social concern and affecting the general populace - case reports from Eastern India

**Reviewer's code:** 00068235

**Reviewer's country:** Pakistan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-05-03 10:52

**Date reviewed:** 2016-05-23 12:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Spread of HIV 1 among MSM is emerging as a genuine social concern and affecting the general populace- case report from Eastern India" is well written and well presented. In this article the authors presented 2 cases, one MSM who did not take HIV infection seriously and died. The second case was a young MSM, starting treatment leads to improvement in Patient's condition. The paper is suited well for publication in the journal, just minor English language revision required. I will suggest to add couple of lines about the success in the fight against HIV by inclusion in Millennium development goal 6 in the past 15 years 2000-2015 and the targets of Sustainable development goal 3 to end HIV epidemics by 2030. You can also add that there is dire need to screen all MSM for HIV and enroll positive HIV cases for treatment.