

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11496

Title: Nephroprotection in the Oldest Old With Chronic Kidney Disease: Special Considerations

Reviewer code: 02890067

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-24 23:08

Date reviewed: 2014-06-19 05:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I had read this manuscript with a great interest. The article is written in good english. I recommend the acceptance of the manuscript. Regards.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11496

Title: Nephroprotection in the Oldest Old With Chronic Kidney Disease: Special Considerations

Reviewer code: 00504146

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-24 23:08

Date reviewed: 2014-06-19 08:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting and important paper for those physicians who take care of oldest old patients in nephrology clinic. Some minor errors were found: Page 3, line 9: such us? Page 3, line 11: pls spell out 'BSA' and 'MDRD'. Page 3, the sentence 'The first operational geriatrics concept' is too long Page 4, line 7, what is the definition of 'treating physician'? Perhaps just say 'physician'

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11496

Title: Nephroprotection in the Oldest Old With Chronic Kidney Disease: Special Considerations

Reviewer code: 00352837

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-24 23:08

Date reviewed: 2014-05-28 08:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, Dr Musso et al reviewed the nephroprotection in the oldest old with CKD. They discussed about dietary salt, serum hemoglobin, blood pressure, HbA1c, and so on. Although the evidences in treating the oldest old with CKD are lacking, authors should show more evidences to protect CKD patients. In addition, in order to treat the oldest old CKD patients, all-cause mortality is important. Authors should more discuss about mortality. Furthermore, authors should comment to normotensive ischemic AKI (Abuelo, J.G. 2007. Normotensive ischemic acute renal failure. N Engl J Med 357:797-805.).

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11496

Title: Nephroprotection in the Oldest Old With Chronic Kidney Disease: Special Considerations

Reviewer code: 00503392

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-05-24 23:08

Date reviewed: 2014-07-05 20:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I think this is a very important topic and the authors provide a very nice overview of renal-associated factors that need to be assessed within the context of the geriatric population. Unfortunately, the English grammar requires a lot of work, the literature appears to define the "oldest old" as age 85 or older, and please be particularly careful with defining your terms early on in the paper (I would change the phrase "By xxx is meant..." to a phrase such as "The term xxx is defined as...").