

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22572

Title: How do kinases contribute to tonicity-dependent regulation of the transcription factor NFAT5?

Reviewer's code: 00465176

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-09-08 13:46

Date reviewed: 2015-09-09 03:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The clinical significance of this manuscript is unclear. The authors fail to relay the message why the reader would care about the complex mechanisms involved in this pathway. The manuscript lacks focus and is too long with too many details and text. IT can be better summarized with summary figures and tables. For example rather than listing all the details in text they can present tables where they list each kinase and then in separate columns they comment on available in vitro versus in vivo data (animals vs humans) and then another column comments about future steps or if the mechanisms are unknown. Are there any therapeutic implications?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22572

Title: How do kinases contribute to tonicity-dependent regulation of the transcription factor NFAT5?

Reviewer's code: 00503339

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-09-08 13:46

Date reviewed: 2015-09-10 04:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This thorough and well written study of kinases that may intensify or block the effect of transcription factor NFAT5 is of broad interest and should prompt investigators to explore the value of blocking of microvascular disease, especially in those afflicted with diabetes. A major concern, however, is the established reality that major effects in blocking progression of vasculopathy and nephropathy in induced diabetes in rodents have not been translated to clinically useful clues to therapy in human subjects with diabetes. As examples, the high promise of blocking Advanced Glycosylated Endproduct (AGE) formation in induced diabetes in rodents based on treatment with Ruboxistaurin, Alagebrium, or Pyridoxamine all failed in clinical trials in patients. As shown in Zhou's Figure 1, the number of concurrent agents that may effect induction and progression of microvasculopathy is vast and most have still to be tested in trials of induced diabetes. Thus, this limitation in accepting the promise of initial studies in rodents should be added to the finish paper to be published. Overall, the field is just opening and should be fully studied due to its great promise.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22572

Title: How do kinases contribute to tonicity-dependent regulation of the transcription factor NFAT5?

Reviewer's code: 00102963

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-09-08 13:46

Date reviewed: 2015-09-15 10:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Excellent Basic Science Review Paper. Should Be Accepted as it Is!