

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24549

**Title:** Metformin associated lactic acidosis in Auckland City Hospital 2005 to 2009

**Reviewer's code:** 00503286

**Reviewer's country:** Romania

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-27 15:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-29 17:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper "Metformin associated lactic acidosis in Auckland City Hospital 2005 to 2009" should be published in WJN, after minor corrections with the editor.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24549

**Title:** Metformin associated lactic acidosis in Auckland City Hospital 2005 to 2009

**Reviewer's code:** 00351120

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-27 15:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-31 14:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Study design was not clearly given.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24549

**Title:** Metformin associated lactic acidosis in Auckland City Hospital 2005 to 2009

**Reviewer's code:** 00503002

**Reviewer's country:** Australia

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-27 15:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-10 13:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written retrospective report on a clinically relevant issue of metformin associate lactic acidosis. It adds to the literature and describes the incidence and clinical outcomes of MALA in a specific region in NewZealnd. It only needs minor changes for acceptance for publication. Changes, suggestions and clarifications needed from me are tracked in the document I have uploaded. Please see the uploaded manuscript with tracked changes and comments.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24549

**Title:** Metformin associated lactic acidosis in Auckland City Hospital 2005 to 2009

**Reviewer's code:** 00503179

**Reviewer's country:** Denmark

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-27 15:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-11 02:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper comprises a retrospective analysis of the incidence of Metformin associated lactic acidosis (MALA). The population was around 400.000 inhabitants living in Auckland around Auckland City Hospital, and the period was between July 2005 and July 2009. The analysis has been well performed. Key results were an incidence of MALA of 19.46 per 100.000 patient year exposure and a relative risk of lactic acidosis in patients on Metformin around 13-14 compared to the general population. The scientific problem is clearly presented in introduction. Subject and methods are adequately described. The results are presented clearly with informative tables and a figure. The discussion is relevant. To sum up, interesting information about the occurrence and clinical course of MALA.