BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27079
Title: What is the optimal level of vitamin D in non-dialysis chronic kidney disease population?
Reviewer's code: 00152215
Reviewer's country: Italy
Science editor: Shui Qiu
Date sent for review: 2016-05-11 18:30
Date reviewed: 2016-05-15 03:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In a group of 470 non-dialysis 3-5 stage CKD patients the Authors evaluated the relationship between 25(OH)D levels and cardiorenal outcomes over a 3-year follow-up. They found that 25(OH)D < 20 ng/ml was an independent predictor of all-cause mortality and kidney progression. This is an interesting study with several major limitations: ? Relatively small study group for these endpoints ? This is a retrospective study in essence ? 25OH D values were evaluated only at baseline and some patients subsequently received vitamin D supplements ? How were cutoff values of D Vitamin identified? Why not analyse data on the basis of tertiles or quartiles? What was the distribution of baseline 25 OH values? Given the above reported limitations I find that the Authors should therefore tone down considerably their conclusions

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Nephrology
ESPS manuscript NO: 27079
Title: What is the optimal level of vitamin D in non-dialysis chronic kidney disease population?
Reviewer's code: 00503196
Reviewer's country: Greece
Science editor: Shui Qiu
Date sent for review: 2016-05-11 18:30
Date reviewed: 2016-05-25 00:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper with the title : << What is The Optimal Level of Vitamin D in non-Dialysis CKD Population? Re-Evaluating Thresholds for Serum 25(OH)D Concentrations in Relation to Death, Kidney Progression and Hospitalization >> is an interesting well written article and the authors claim that their study << as the first prospective which analyzed the upper level of Vit D associated to better improvement in survival and CKD progression on CKD patients, did not demonstrate additional benefits on these hard outcomes when patients reached the optimal target levels for VD suggested by current guidelines (≥30ng/ml).So with this study, despite the limitations, the authors provide a new option in this so controversial field of Vitamin D treatment in CKD patients .