

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28134

**Title:** Factors associating with oxygenation of lower-limb muscle tissue in hemodialysis patients

**Reviewer's code:** 00503339

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-06-29 09:46

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-08 20:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Worthwhile study of a reasonable number of patients undergoing maintenance hemodialysis with attention focused on use of Regional saturation of oxygen (rSO<sub>2</sub>) as a potential measure of satisfactory attention to whole body status during Maintenance Hemodialysis. The one "control" needed for grasping the full significance of a decreased oxygen (rSO<sub>2</sub>) in an ongoing dialysis patient is exploring whether decreased values might be related to anemia rather than insufficient duration of dialysis per se. Overall, proposal of a fresh variable to help explain unexpected severity of anemia in patients on maintenance hemodialysis is worth exploration, especially to note whether anemia due to an cause, might be sufficient to alter oxygen saturation (rSO<sub>2</sub>) in otherwise well dialyzed patients. Provocative and worthwhile.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28134

**Title:** Factors associating with oxygenation of lower-limb muscle tissue in hemodialysis patients

**Reviewer's code:** 02505674

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-06-29 09:46

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-10 07:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Authors performed a very interesting and well conducted study aimed at evaluating the factors influencing regional muscular oxygenation in patients underwent hemodialysis. The adopted statistical approach is convincing and the conclusions are supported by the findings reported. I have no remark on the study.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28134

**Title:** Factors associating with oxygenation of lower-limb muscle tissue in hemodialysis patients

**Reviewer's code:** 00289581

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-06-29 09:46

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-11 06:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Factors affecting oxygenation of lower-limb muscle tissue in hemodialysis patients: muscle oxygenation is associated with nutritional status, including serum inorganic phosphate and albumin concentrations Haruhisa Miyazawa, Susumu Ookawara, Kiyonori Ito, Katsunori Yanai, Hiroki Ishii, Taisuke Kitano, Mitsutoshi Shindo, Yuichiro Ueda, Yoshio Kaku, Keiji Hirai, Taro Hoshino, Kaoru Tabei, Yoshiyuki Morishita This is an observational study which looks at the relationship of lower-limb muscle oxygenation in hemodialysis patients and attempts to identify the factors affecting muscle oxygenation. Main problems: The investigators did not perform arterial vascular studies prior to the oxygenation score. Subclinical or clinical arterial disease could be responsible for these findings. How did you determine the number of patients and controls to do? Were all subjects from the same dialysis unit? Was there a power analysis? Participants: Define the following in the manuscript: Inclusion criteria, what is meant by unimpaired consciousness? Exclusion criteria, what is meant by symptomatic ischemia of the lower? How was this determined? Was a physical exam done of the lower limb arterial circulation? Were any type of arterial dopplers done on any of the



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

subjects? URR and Kt/V (clearance data) and other nutritional data (PCR) should be included in this analysis; these variables may affect the results. Need to include more description of the dialysis treatment, what dialyzers etc., were used? Were the controls screened for any medical problems? I am concerned regarding the use of a blood sample from the arterial limb of the AVF. Did all subjects have an AVF? Did some have catheter or AVG access? This will affect the results. Results: How do you interpret a negative correlation with duration of hemodialysis? Discussion: Overall very poorly written. First paragraph should summarize the main findings of the study. As written the first paragraph summarizes previous investigation by the authors. Would not make conclusions based on this study, it is only an observation.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Nephrology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28134

**Title:** Factors associating with oxygenation of lower-limb muscle tissue in hemodialysis patients

**Reviewer's code:** 00503199

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-06-29 09:46

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-25 05:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study. However clarification is needed. Major concern is the distribution of the parameters studied as you have handled them as being all of them normally distributed. If this is the case, please provide this information in the text, otherwise you will have to redo the analysis using non-parametric tests and transformation of the non-normally distributed parameters. In addition, I wonder if you can examine at this stage the association of other parameters of malnutrition (BMI, nPCR etc) from the data that you have. Finally, I am not sure if the control group adds in this study. If I understand well it was not matched to the HD group (you have to provide the characteristics of the control group), thus I would consider delete it, as it is of limited and uncertain value. Other comments Abstract: - Conclusion (also in main text): "was affected by" Please write ...was associated with.... Observational studies provide correlations not causations. - Provide also a brief limitations' section in the abstract. Introduction: - Aims: "(2) clarify the mechanism influencing the value of lower-limb muscle oxygenation in HD patients" You examine associations, not mechanism Methods: - Provide additional exclusion criteria, such as catheter as an



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

access. Was amputation an exclusion criterion? - Measurement of rSO<sub>2</sub> in both legs? In the dominant one? Please explain. - Control group: Provide site of arterial blood sampling Data analysis: - Correlations between parameters (not groups). - Were all the parameters studied normally distributed? You have only used pearson's r, that is for normal distribution. Results: - provide characteristics of the control group Limitations: Add additional limitations: - You have not examined other indices of malnutrition - wasting: BMI, waist circumference, wait/hip circumference, biceps and triceps measurements, loss of body weight the last 6 months, normalized protein catabolic rate etc. - You have not examined the use of phosphate binders - The control group was not matched to the HD group - You have not measured parameters of peripheral artery disease. (you have already mentioned it in a previous paragraph, but you can also remind it in the limitations section) Table 1. Provide p-values and r for all the parameters (not just ns). You can have in bold those statistically significant if you like Table 2. Provide additional data as CI etc that are shown in the statistical package