

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Translational Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 16735

Title: Component Resolved Diagnostic Testing: The New Frontier

Reviewer's code: 00503068

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-01-28 14:54

Date reviewed: 2015-02-04 17:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, Tallar and Grayson give a short review on the promises of component resolved diagnostic testing. The authors describe proposed uses for CRD in different allergic syndromes. The manuscript is well written, but readability could be further enhanced by using additional subheadings (e.g. in section food allergy). Including a table comparing CRD vs single component may be useful.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Translational Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 16735

Title: Component Resolved Diagnostic Testing: The New Frontier

Reviewer's code: 00070848

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-01-28 14:54

Date reviewed: 2015-02-01 17:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Re: "Component Resolved Diagnostic Testing: The New Frontier" This is an interesting review highlighting the importance of many different proteins in a known allergen some of which drive allergic responses and others do not. In this aspect, the component resolved diagnostics micro-assay technology that has not been approved by USA FDA, as yet, could prove extremely helpful. This review could enhance its strength if the authors include in a paragraph some additional characteristic examples such as in the question of Kounis syndrome: Why Kounis syndrome or anaphylactic shock occur less often, while allergic, hypersensitivity and anaphylactic events are very common in everyday practice? Is there any specific protein component that induces very dangerous hypersensitivity coronary blow up manifesting as Kounis syndrome or shock? Such identification might pave the way of how to prevent such disastrous anaphylactic consequences. There also reports associating this syndrome with E148q mutation and diagnostics micro-assay technology could assist in identification of genetic predisposition.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Translational Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 16735

Title: Component Resolved Diagnostic Testing: The New Frontier

Reviewer's code: 02445885

Reviewer's country: Afghanistan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-01-28 14:54

Date reviewed: 2015-02-03 09:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The title of the editorial "Component Resolved Diagnostic Testing: The New Frontier" may be confusing in the high-quality World Journal of Translational Medicine. The editorial is in fact about molecular-based allergy diagnostics. Although the "component-resolved diagnosis" concept is frequently used (usually with hyphen) in scientific articles, the word allergy must be present in the title, because other diseases, such as different types of cancer, benefit nowadays from molecular diagnosis biomarkers as well. Therefore, a title such as "Molecular-based Allergy Diagnostics: The New Frontier" or "Component-Resolved Allergy Testing: The New Frontier" or "Component-Resolved Allergy Diagnosis: The New Frontier" is more appropriate [De Knop KJ, Bridts CH, Verweij MM, Hagendorens MM, De Clerck LS, Stevens WJ, Ebo DG. Component-resolved allergy diagnosis by microarray: potential, pitfalls, and prospects. *Adv Clin Chem*. 2010;50:87-101. Review. PubMed PMID: 20521442; Ebo DG. Component-resolved allergy diagnosis: a new era? *Verh K Acad Geneesk Belg*. 2011;73(3-4):163-79. Review. PubMed PMID: 22482195]. Moreover, in the World Allergy Organization WAO-ARIA-GA2LEN consensus document on molecular-based allergy diagnostics, the concept of "Component-resolved diagnostics (CRD)" is referred to as

molecular-based allergy diagnostics [Canonica GW, Ansotegui IJ, Pawankar R, Schmid-Grendelmeier P, van Hage M, Baena-Cagnani CE, Melioli G, Nunes C, Passalacqua G, Rosenwasser L, Sampson H, Sastre J, Bousquet J, Zuberbier T; WAO-ARIA-GA2LEN Task Force: Katrina Allen, Riccardo Asero, Barbara Bohle, Linda Cox, Frederic de Blay, Motohiro Ebisawa, Rene Maximiliano-Gomez, Sandra Gonzalez-Diaz, Tari Haahtela, Stephen Holgate, Thilo Jakob, Mark Larche, Paolo Maria Matricardi, John Oppenheimer, Lars K Poulsen, Harald E Renz, Nelson Rosario, Marc Rothenberg, Mario Sanchez-Borges, Enrico Scala, Rudolf Valenta. A WAO-ARIA-GA2LEN consensus document on molecular-based allergy diagnostics. *World Allergy Organ J.* 2013 Oct 3;6(1):17. doi: 10.1186/1939-4551-6-17. PubMed PMID: 24090398; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC3874689]. Allergen components are not properly written, according to the IUIS Allergen Nomenclature (www.allergen.org). The first three letters and the one after the space (which define the genus and the species respectively), and the cypher for the number of allergens, must not be italicized (as written along the entire editorial). This type of abbreviation is also according to the World Allergy Organization WAO-ARIA-GA2LEN consensus document on molecular-based allergy diagnostics [Canonica GW, Ansotegui IJ, Pawankar R, Schmid-Grendelmeier P, van Hage M, Baena-Cagnani CE, Melioli G, Nunes C, Passalacqua G, Rosenwasser L, Sampson H, Sastre J, Bousquet J, Zuberbier T; WAO-ARIA-GA2LEN Task Force: Katrina Allen, Riccardo Asero, Barbara Bohle, Linda Cox, Frederic de Blay, Motohiro Ebisawa, Rene Maximiliano-Gomez, Sandra Gonzalez-Diaz, Tari Haahtela, Stephen Holgate, Thilo Jakob, Mark Larche, Paolo Maria Matricardi, John Oppenheimer, Lars K Poulsen, Harald E Renz, Nelson Rosario, Marc Rothenberg, Mario Sanchez-Borges, Enrico Scala, Rudolf Valenta. A WAO-ARIA-GA2LEN consensus document on molecular-based allergy diagnostics. *World Allergy Organ J.* 2013 Oct 3;6(1):17. doi: 10.1186/1939-4551-6-17. PubMed PMID: 24090398; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC3874689]. Some English language polishing are required. In the "Abstract", several words are used redundant in consecutive sentences, such as "revolutionized" and "revolutionizing". The authors consider that "the use of component testing for aeroallergen immunotherapy has been studied, but as of yet its utility is unclear", and the assessment as "unclear" is not accurate, having in mind that the World Allergy Organization WAO-ARIA-GA2LEN consensus document mentions that "molecular-based allergy diagnostics represents a useful tool to distinguish genuine sensitisations from cross-reactions in poly-sensitized patients, when