

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Translational Medicine

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 20211

**Title:** Nutritional determinants of anemia among adults in eastern China

**Reviewer's code:** 02446296

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-06-02 13:51

**Date reviewed:** 2015-06-04 10:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript discussed "Nutritional determinants of anemia among adults in Eastern China" based on the available data. It is well written, and will be interesting to readers of this journal.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Translational Medicine

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 20211

**Title:** Nutritional determinants of anemia among adults in eastern China

**Reviewer's code:** 02446183

**Reviewer's country:** United Kingdom

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-06-02 13:51

**Date reviewed:** 2015-06-04 20:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors review data suggesting that anemia in this particular region of China may not be due to iron deficiency but due to other factors such as riboflavin and magnesium deficiency or related to MSG intake. In the Abstract: I am not sure if riboflavin can be described as a micronutrient. "Over the past several decades, the prevalence of anemia decreased substantially but remains high". Why, in the context of their findings, is the prevalence of anemia decreasing? What relevance can this have in strengthening their findings? They mention that iron-rich soy sauce is used to treat anemia despite the fact that the actual cause may not be iron deficiency. Can the authors comment on the efficacy of this iron enriched soya supplementation? Does it have a positive effect on anemia after all, or is the benefit negligible? Any data in using riboflavin supplementation in clinically improving anemia will strengthen their case. It may be worth expanding on this in the clinical sense. "Although Tofu intake was inversely associated with persistent anemia during follow-up, it was positively related to incident anemia but inversely related to anemia resolving". Why is this so? Is tofu also enriched with iron, or how does tofu affect iron, ferritin or Hb levels? They say: "However, when riboflavin intake is adequate, iron intake is not a determinant of anemia"... So then, if



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

riboflavin intake is adequate, what is the cause of anemia in these patients? What dietary recommendations do they make? Increase riboflavin and magnesium intake, or regulate use of MSG? How would we know in practical terms that the intake is adequate for prevention of anemia and that it will not cause excessive elevation of Hb? Are these recommendations possible in the local culture? In short, the authors should comment further on the translational aspects of their findings, and not merely state that iron is not the main cause of anemia. Spelling error: "The possible mechanisms linking MSG and anemia may include the increased secretion of gastric acid and leptin": it should be 'increased secretion'...

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Translational Medicine

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 20211

**Title:** Nutritional determinants of anemia among adults in eastern China

**Reviewer's code:** 02446043

**Reviewer's country:** Malaysia

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-06-02 13:51

**Date reviewed:** 2015-06-07 18:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting paper that should be accepted, since it attempts explaining a treatable condition anaemia, and suggests that it is not the commonly considered -iron deficiency - that actually causes this condition. Authors should: i) consider whether hereditary haemoglobinopathy plays a role in anaemia in Eastern China since thalassemia can cause anaemia with elevated serum ferritin and is a common condition in the Chinese population. ii) provide examples around the world where riboflavin (and magnesium) insufficiency has been established as the cause of anaemia since they suggest that in Eastern China it is in fact the inadequate dietary intake of riboflavin (and magnesium) that causes the anaemia